















































In this regard, the Committee observed that payment of various personnel recruited by MCI on similar posts is as under:

#	Post	Remuneration
1	Chief Consultant	Rs.60,000/- p.m.
2	Consultants	Rs.60,000/- p.m.

It was further observed that experts, coordinators, etc. when invited by MCI for any work are paid remuneration of Rs. 5,000/ day. Members of MCI are paid remuneration of Rs. 3,000/ day for attending any meeting or for any work of MCI.

In view of above, it was decided to approve the payment of various personnel engaged by Oversight Committee be paid as under:

Sl.No.	Name & Designation	Remuneration(inRs.)	Date of Engagement	Tenure
1.	Dr. R.N. Salhan, Technical Consultant	Rs.1,25,000 per month	16/06/2016	6 months
2.	Ms. Shalini Solanki, Research Associate	Rs.50,000/- per month	01/07/2016	6 months
3.	Sh. Raj Kumar Choudhary, P.S. to Members	Rs. 15,000/- per month	23/05/2016	6 months
4.	Dr. Rakesh Aggarwal, Part-time Expert	Rs. 5,000/- per day	16/07/2016	1 month
5.	Dr. Y.K. Gupta, Part-time Expert	Rs. 5,000/- per day	02/08/2016	2 months
6.	Ms. Manie Ahuja, Research Associate	Rs. 50,000/- per month	02/08/2016	3 months

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to also enhance the pay of MCI Consultants working in the Council Office from existing Rs. 60,000/- to Rs. 90,000/- per month.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**24. Minutes of the meeting of Departmental Promotion Committee held on 05/08/2016 for considering promotion to the post of Stenographer Grade – II.**

Read: the matter with regard to minutes of the meeting of Departmental Promotion Committee held on 05/08/2016 for considering promotion to the post of Stenographer Grade – II.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Departmental Promotion Committee meeting held on 05.08.2016 recommending that Mrs. Manju Rani and Mrs. Swati Oberoi be promoted to the post of Stenographer Grade – II in accordance with the Recruitment Rules of the Council.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**25. Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry.**

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> & 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 40 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 66 % as detailed in the report.
3. Bed Occupancy on day of assessment is 14 % (i.e. 96 genuine patients out of 680 beds).
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 377 which is grossly inadequate.
5. There is no admission in NICU since 15/05/2016 – i.e. more than 2 months. Occupancy in ICCU and also in PICU/NICU was NIL on day of assessment. Although Ventilator was available, there was NIL patient on Ventilator.
6. Only 5 patients have died in the whole hospital in 2016 indicating very low turnout of serious & difficult patients.
7. There are only 15 deliveries in 2016 till date – i.e. 2-3/month which is grossly inadequate. Last Normal Delivery was on 18/07/2016 (i.e. before 1 week) & last Caesarean Section was on 14/07/2016 (i.e. before 10 days).
8. Laboratory Investigations data provided by the institute do not corroborate with available clinical material.
9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

The Committee further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1).....

- (c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.”

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year

(2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

**26. Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.**

Read: the matter with regard to Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) alongwith previous compliance verification assessment reports 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010.

In view of the above decision of revoking the Clause 8(3)(1)(c), the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry be continued restricting the number of admissions to 100 (One hundred) students per year and the same be placed before the General Body of the Council.

**27. Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana.**

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2016) along with complaint dated 18.05.2016 received from Shri Mandadapu Sudhakar, Khammam, Telangana and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred Fifty) students.

**28. Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot.**

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot.



The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot be continued restricting the number of admission to 100 (One Hundred) students.

**29. Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University for the academic year 2017-18.**

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Students' Hostels: There are no separate hostels for medical students/interns/Residents. In the same hostel, Medical & Dental students (of MDS & BDS) are accommodated. Random checking revealed that the following Dental students/Interns are allotted rooms in hostels meant for Medical students: (P. 31)
  - (a) In Girls' hostel, in room # 320, Ms. S. Fathima & Ms. Reshma, both BDS students;
  - (b) In Girls' hostel, in room # 408, Ms. Divya;
  - (c) In Girls' hostel, in room # 810, Dr. Nandani (Intern);
  - (d) In Boys' hostel, in room # 903, Dr. R. Calvin & Dr. T. Singh (MDS students);
  - (e) In Boys' hostel, in room # 710 & 602, Rohit Korkam & Rahul Narula (BDS students).
2. There is no proper waiting room in both the hostels.
3. There are no separate Residential Quarters for Non-teaching staff.
4. OPD: Registered patients in OPD did not tally with OPD attendance in individual OPDs. E.g. Orthopaedics registration was 86 patients but OPD attendance was only 40 & 05 patients in waiting area making total of 45. In DVD, registration was 60 patients but OPD attendance was only 42 with NIL patient in waiting area. This was common for almost all the OPDs.
5. Histopathology workload was only 03 on day of assessment.
6. Casualty: There were only 04 patients in Casualty on day of assessment at 12:00 p.m.
7. Occupancy in ICCU was only 01 on day of assessment.
8. Anatomy department: Tutors' room is not available.
9. Pathology department: Tutors' room is inadequate.
10. Community Medicine department: Tutors' room is not available.
11. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
12. RHTC: Cold Chain Equipment is not available. It is registered by CMO as Nursing Home / Hospital & not as RHTC as such. Number of deliveries is only 1-2/month. Interns did not have any log book. Paramedical staff like Health Educator are not available.
13. UHC: Cold chain equipment is not available. It is running in a leased house, located in market area and not easily approachable. Paramedical staff are not as per MCI norms.
14. There is no signature board of School of Medicine & Research in the University campus.
15. Canteen: Staff canteen is under construction. Students' canteen is not available.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01(One) month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council

**30. Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.**

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> & 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010.

In view of the above decision of revoking the Clause 8(3)(1)(c), the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu be continued restricting the number of admissions to 100 (One hundred) students per year and the same be placed before the General Body of the Council.

**31. A.C.S Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under the ambit of Dr. M.G.R Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University) Chennai – Renewal of permission for admission of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2017-2018.**

Read: the matter with regard to A.C.S Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under the ambit of Dr. M.G.R Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University) Chennai – Renewal of permission for admission of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee observed that on the recommendation of the MCI, the MH & FW, Government of India had issued notification No. U.12012/670/2015-M.E-I dated 16.05.2016 granting for renewal of permission for admission of Fresh Batch of 150 M.B.B.S students for the academic year 2016-2017 at A.C.S. Medical College and Hospital under Dr. M.G.R. Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University), Chennai, Tamilnadu. Further, the permission was valid for one year and for admitting only one batch of 150 students during the academic session 2016-2017. The next batch of 150 students in M.B.B.S. course will be admitted in the college only after permission of Central Government for renewal/recognition.

Accordingly, the Council vide its letter dated 18.07.2016 requested the Dean/Principal, A.C.S Medical College & Hospital, Chennai to submit the C.D./D.V.D. with regard to standard inspection forms and declaration forms etc. for assessment for renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at ACS Medical College & Hospital, Chennai for the Academic Session 2017-18.

In reply, the institute vide letter dt. 21/07/2016 has represented as under:

“... Under the above circumstances, we humbly request the Medical Council of India,

- a) To recommend to MH & FW to remove the term “2009-10 ONLY” mentioned in the recognition order dated 01.04.2016.
- b) To recommend to the MH & FW to recognize the institution A.CS Medical College and Hospital continuously from the year 2008-09 and beyond and remove the term “Fresh Batch” in their order dated 16.05.2016.
- c) Exempt us from applying for “renewal of permission for 2nd batch” as mentioned in your letter dated 18.07.2016, in as much as our college has to be treated as a recognized college for the above mentioned reasons.
- d) The instructions issued in the MCI letter 3rd cited may be revised accordingly.”

It was also observed that in this connection, opinion from Ld. ASG was obtained earlier; the operative part of the opinion dt. 25/02/2016 reads as under:

“.....22. It is in this background that the querist has sought my opinion regarding the status of the students of the medical college who were admitted in academic year 2009-10. As far as the students admitted in academic session 2009-10 are concerned, their rights have been protected by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgement dated 11.02.2015 in para 45.3, wherein it has been categorically held that on qualifying in the final examination conducted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, the students may be allowed to begin their internship program and on successful completion of the same, they be awarded their MBBS degrees subject to the final decision in the case of Viprav Sharma. Therefore, I am of the view that the students who were admitted in the academic session 2009-10, after successfully qualifying the final examination conducted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences and who have now completed their internship, be granted registration by the appropriate State Medical Council where after an appropriate entry in this regard be made in the Indian Medical Register.

23. In respect of the second issue regarding the status of the medical college, I am of the view that since no permission was granted to the applicant medical college during the academic sessions 2010-11, 2011-12, 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 & 2015-16, **it would be appropriate if the querist found that the medical college has now been able to fulfil the minimum infrastructural requirements as per the regulations of the querist, applicant medical college can be considered for grant of permission for admitting fresh batch of students for the academic year 2016-17 where after the medical College shall be eligible to be considered for recognition at the time of the final MBBS examination of the batch of 2016-17.”**

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain further opinion of Ld. ASG in the matter on the specific issues raised by the institute in its letter dt. 21/07/2016 mentioned above.

**32. Issuance of Eligibility Certificate to the Indian Nationals/Overseas citizen of India who desirous to take admission in MBBS or equivalent course in a medical university/institution outside India.**

Read: the matter with regard to issuance of Eligibility Certificate to the Indian Nationals/Overseas citizen of India who desirous to take admission in MBBS or equivalent course in a medical university/institution outside India.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Eligibility Section is receiving numerous calls, representations, RTI applications etc. from the applicants/parents seeking the stand of the Medical Council of India with regard to the issuance of Eligibility Certificate/acceptance of application forms for Eligibility Certificate in respect of students who have already taken admission in MBBS or equivalent medical course in various medical



universities/institutions outside the country from May, 2013 till the Academic year 2015-16.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the opinion of Law Officer for re-starting the issuance of Eligibility Certificate and act accordingly.

**33. To consider grant of the permission to Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhopal to provide the medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction.**

Read: the matter with regard to grant of the permission to Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhopal to provide the medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Vice Chancellor of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya in his letter requesting for permission to provide medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction has also stated *inter alia* as under:

*"It is to be mentioned here specifically that the Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) in the field of Higher Education is approximately 19 to 20 percent. In the field of medical education, it is even lesser. One reason of less gross enrolment ratio is conducting all the courses through English medium. Today, there are many students in rural and urban areas who possess talent of medical but due to hindrance of language, they cannot come in medical field."*

It was also observed that no valid statistics have been provided as to how such a conclusion has been arrived at.

In view of above, the Committee decided that Vice Chancellor of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya be requested to provide the basis and detailed statistics for arriving at such a conclusion. It was further decided that he may also be requested to provide a list of the medical books, journals and other reading material translated/written in Hindi.

**34. Compliance Verification assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.**

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (14<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) along with the previous assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> & 12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.71 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 24.07 % as detailed in the report.
3. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is still < 1.5 m required as per Regulations.
4. There are only 05 Major operations on day of assessment.
5. Casualty: Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available.
6. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 Static & 3 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 & 4 respectively.

7. CT Scan is outsourced.
8. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not of Gallery type.
9. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
10. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology is only 03 & 05 respectively on day of assessment which is inadequate.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

**35. Recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter to the next meeting.

**36. Recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

**37. Recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(29<sup>th</sup> July, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (06<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) as well as letter/representation dated 04/08/2016 received from the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

**38. Approval of the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 and observed as under:-

***Item 3: Implementation of 7<sup>th</sup> Central Pay Commission***

*The Members of Executive Committee further noted the comments of the Consultant Finance on the implementation of recommendations of 7<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission – fixation of pay and payment of arrears – instructions and decided to approve the proposal.*

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***



**Item 4: Grant of Special Allowances to Employees of the Council:**

Minutes are incomplete. While it is recorded that "The Committee came with the opinion that the matter be placed before the Executive Committee bringing out the fact that allowances sanctioned by Executive Committee in its meeting held on 16/03/2015 is not covered in the existing Rule. The continuance / rationalization of allowances to these employees and amount of allowance needs to be reconsidered/reviewed", it is not brought out how the decision of Executive Committee dt. 16/03/2015 was arrived at. It is also not shown whether the abovesaid decision of the Executive Committee was pursuant to recommendation of Finance Committee or any other Sub Committee or not. It was also observed that no specific recommendation/proposal has been made by Finance Committee for review/reconsideration.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back with above observation to take appropriate decision.

**Item 5: Grant of Conveyance Allowance to officials for attending office on Holidays:**

Minutes are incomplete. While it is recorded that "The Committee after going through the issue and taking cognizance that point also has been under audit objection, decided that the matter be placed before Executive Committee for consideration, devising a methodology/procedure defining the scope of facility of granting conveyance allowance to staff for attending office on Saturday, Sunday & Holiday", it is not brought out what is the audit objection and whether any reply has been given for such an objection. It was also observed that no specific recommendation/proposal has been made by Finance Committee for devising a methodology/procedure defining the scope of facility of granting conveyance allowance to staff for attending office on Saturday, Sunday & Holiday.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back with above observation to take appropriate decision.

**Item 6: Investment of FDRs:**

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the investment of FDRs.

**39. Proposal to amend Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.**

Read: the matter with regard to proposal to amend establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proposal of the Ministry of Health & F.W. and directed the office to prepare draft amendment accordingly for Government of India approval.

**40. Matter with regard to holding of meeting of Raghavan Committee.**

Read: the matter with regard to holding of meeting of Raghavan Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law Officer, operative part of which reads as under:

"...I respectfully disagree with the view of the Administration and Grievance Committee that "there is no precedence of holding such kind of meeting with different organizations which do not fall under the protocol of the Council. The menace of Ragging is serious and is required to be curbed with stringent measures. Consultation with stakeholders, that may be different organizations, would be conducive to enhancing the anti-ragging mechanism laid down in

*Council Regulations. Therefore I am of the considered view that the Executive Committee as part of the Council's measures to curb ragging in Medical Colleges consider the proposal of Raghavan Committee to hold such a meeting favourably."*

After due deliberations, the Committee decided to approve the opinion of Law Officer and directed the office to convene a meeting of Raghavan Committee at the earliest in consultation with Ministry of HRD & UGC.

**41. Amendment in the MSR(Minimum Standard Requirements Regulations for 50/100/150/200/250 annual MBBS admissions and Phasewise Requirements for LOP and Renewals.**

Read: the matter with regard to amendment in the MSR(Minimum Standard Requirements Regulations for 50/100/150/200/250 annual MBBS admissions and Phasewise Requirements for LOP and Renewals.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that with regard to Clause 4 of Part I & II, Central Government vide letter dt. 18/07/2016 has proposed the following changes:

Clause	Present Provision	As proposed by the Council	As approved in the Ministry
4 of Part-I	Applications found complete in all respects shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within 30 days from the date of receipt of it for evaluation and recommendations.	Applications <b>found complete in all respects</b> shall be registered by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations	Applications <b>received in prescribed proforma along with requisite fee</b> shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations.
4 of Part-II	Applications found complete in all respects will be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to Council within 30 days from the date of receiving it all for evaluation and recommendations.	Applications <b>found complete in all respects</b> shall be registered by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations	Applications <b>received in prescribed proforma along with requisite fee</b> shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for scrutiny, evaluation and recommendation.

In this connection, it was observed that the words "**found complete in all respects**" were inserted in the proposed amendment pursuant to Order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Royal Trust & D.Y. Patil cases.

The Committee further noted the following relevant portion of the *Hon'ble Supreme Court judgment dated 20/08/2015 in W.P.(C) No. 705/2015-Royal Medical Trust(Regd.) and Another Vs. Union of India and Anrs.-*

*".....(A) Initial assessment of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent of affiliation and physical features like land and*



*hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage....”*

The Committee further noted the following relevant portion of the Hon'ble Supreme Court judgment dated 20/08/2015 in SLP.(C) No. 15043/2015- Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College Vs. Medical Council of India & Anr...:-

16. *In W.P. (C) No.705/2014 – Royal Medical Trust (Regd.) and Anr. V. Union of India & Anr. decided on 20.8.2015, this Court has observed that the Schedule must take care of following aspects:*

*“(A) Initial assesment of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.*

*(B) Inspection should then be conducted by the Inspectors of the MCI. By very nature such inspection must have an element of surprise. Therefore, sufficient time of about three to four months ought to be given to the MCI to cause inspection at any time and such inspection should normally be undertaken latest by January. Surprise inspection would ensure that the required facilities and infrastructure are always in place and not borrowed or put in temporarily.*

*(C) Intimation of the result or outcome of the inspection would then be communicated. If the infrastructure and facilities are in order, the concerned Medical College should be given requisite permission/renewal. However if there are any deficiencies or shortcomings, the MCI must, after pointing out the deficiencies, grant to the college concerned sufficient time to report compliance.*

*(D) If compliance is reported and the applicant states that the deficiencies stand removed, the MCI must cause compliance verification. It is possible that such compliance could be accepted even without actual physical verification but that assessment be left entirely to the discretion of the MCI and the Central Government. In cases where actual physical verification is required, the MCI and the Central Government must cause such verification before the deadline.*

*(E) The result of such verification if positive in favour of the Medical College concerned, the applicant ought to be given requisite permission/renewal. But if the deficiencies still persist or had not been removed, the applicant will stand disentitled so fare as that academic year is concerned.”*

*It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process.”*

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to place factual matrix once again before Central Government requesting Central Govt. to approve the amendment as proposed by MCI.

**42. Recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> August, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 77.5 % as detailed in the report.
2. No faculty was available in the department of Radiodiagnosis on day of assessment.
3. Shortage of Residents is 78.6 % as detailed in the report.
4. Bed occupancy was 30.61 % on day of assessment at 12 noon.
5. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload were grossly inadequate on day of assessment.
6. Although institute provided a list of 372 Nursing staff, only about 60 were observed to be working in the wards on day of assessment.
7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL LSCS on day of assessment.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Committee further decided that the decision with regard to applying clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 against Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Tamilnadu for two academic years i.e. 2016-2017 and 2017-2018 be continued.

The Committee noted the email dated 22.08.2016 received from the Director of Medical Education, Chennai informing that the local holidays are declared by the Collector of the District for religious functions for administrative reasons. These holidays will be compensated by a State or Central declared holiday which will thence be declared as a working day. The DME has enclosed Order of the District Collector, Kancheepuram District which states that due to mela at Sri Vedagivishwavar temple at Kancheepuram, all the Govt. Offices and Educational Institutions will remain close on 2.8.2016 and for compensating the same, the offices and educational institutions will remain open on 13.8.2016.

In view of above, the Committee decided to conduct the compliance verification inspection of the institute.

**43. Recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> August, 2016) along with previous assessment report(22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of

Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

The Executive Committee further noted that clause 8(3)(1)(d) as recommended by the Ethics Committee at its meeting dated 3<sup>rd</sup> & 4<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 and approved by the Executive Committee on 15.06.2016 had been applied against the college. The said clause reads as under:-

8(3)(1)(d):

(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked / forged documents:

If it is observed that any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked / forged documents and have submitted the Declaration Form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission / recognition for award of M.B.B.S. degree / processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two Academic Years – i.e. that Academic Year and the next Academic Year also....."

In view of above, the Committee decided that the Institute be directed not to admit fresh batch of students for the academic year 2016-17 and 2017-18.

**44. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur.**

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (21.04.2016 & 22.04.2016) as well as letter dated 26.07.2016 from the MCI assessors which reads as under:

1. *"The afore stated MCI assessment was scheduled for 25/7/16. It was rescheduled to 26/7/16 in an e.mail received by us.*
2. *We reached college gate at 9.40 am. The guard on duty got into our car and escorted us to dean's office, as we had requested him to direct us there, but he chose to accompany us in our car.*
3. *We handed over the letter of assessment arrangement to the individual who introduced himself as Dean. However, he then told us he is Dean, faculty, NIMS University & the Principal, NIMS will be coming over to his office & did not sign the acknowledgment.*
4. *However despite 15 minutes of waiting the Principal did not arrive.*



5. Then 2 assessors (Dr. Saple & Dr. Prasad) proceeded towards Principal's cabin.
6. The 3<sup>rd</sup> assessor was escorted by a college employee & introduced to Prof. of Surgery (Dr. Srivani)
7. She assessed bed occupancy at 10 am of Surgery, Orthopaedics, ENT, Ophthalmology, OB&GY. Each ward was not as per MCI norms. Each ward had 54 beds or 100 beds, 108 beds. (Each unit can have >30 beds but each ward has to be max. 30 beds as per MSR). Each ward did not have pantry, demo room, store room, duty room as per requirements.
8. (a) Dr. Saple & Dr. Prasad then proceeded to Principal's cabin. There was not one there. Nor was there anywhere any faculty or staff in college building. Then Dr. Saple met 3 Asst. Prof. in Biochemistry. She requested them to help with assessment. One of them accompanied her for assessing bed occupancy.
- b. Principal eventually arrived 10.13 am & accepted the letter or arrangement.
9. Bed occupancy was assessed in Medicine, Chest & TB, Psychiatry, Dermatology, Pediatrics.  
Wards were of 108 beds not as per MCI norms, some wards had no nursing station (video & photos enclosed).  
A person putatively the Superintendent refused to put his signature & snatched the phone out of co-ordinators hand while filming & tried to throw it down.
10. The signatures of nurses on duty were also enclosed.
11. Attendance with signatures of all residents & faculty was taken till 11 am.
12. The management people were interfering with the work of assessment and were yelling and abusing & refused to listen to the Principal.
13. The co-ordinator and assessors then left the building and waited outside to building to call the third assessor & then the MCI office.
14. As we were waiting outside the Principal called us to her office for discussion.
15. Along with the Principal Management people who said they were also faculty were also in the room & they insisted that this should be an assessment for 150 seats.
16. Dr. Saple called the MCI office & doubly confirmed that the assessment was of 100 seats only.
17. On informing the same, the Principal stated that they would not want to continue the inspection.
18. The Principal stated that she would a letter to that effect. However, despite waiting till 3 pm no letter of refusal was provided. Only a letter stating facts not directly related to assessment was given.
19. No printer was provided at any time.
20. Duty roster, records as per request letter were also not provided.
21. There was no internet facility in college building/Principal office/chamber.
22. There was no computer/photocopier etc. also in Principal's chamber.
23. So, as the Principal refused further assessment, due to interference by management, on their verbal statements the assessors left the campus.
24. The Management once they realized the bed occupancy & attendance was extremely low put forth. The reason at 11.30 am re.150 vs 100 admissions."

#### **Additional points**

- There were 412 patients shown in wards at 10 am in 762 beds in Surgery, Medicine, Paediatrics, Orthopaedics, ENT, Ophthalmology, OBGY, Skin, Psychiatry & Chest & TB wards shown to us which is 54%.
- As number P.G. units, were not divulged to us this occupancy is based on beds shown & patients shown to us.
- Attendance sheets were used for signatures. But there was interference from Management all along.

- Despite requests residents, faculty & management did not leave the lecture hall after putting in their signatures.
- Hence, faculty deficiency cannot be commuted upon as verification process did not take place as assessment was suspended, as later on the college authorities refused to cooperate & stated they did not want further inspection.

The Committee recalled that on an earlier occasion also, similar problems had taken place recorded hereunder:

Dated: 22.04.2016

To

The Secretary (UG Section)  
Medical Council of India  
New Delhi-110 077.

Sub: Problem faced by the assessors during inspection of National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur (NIMS&R, Jaipur).

Respected Madam,

I am Dr. Karabi Baral, Professor of Anatomy, BS Medical College, Bankura; Dr. S. Mohanth, Professor of FMT, MKCG Medical College, Berhampur & Dr. J.A. Jayalal, Professor of Surgery, Kanyakumari Govt. Medical College visited National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur vide No.MCI-37(1)(UG)/2015-Med./ for 100 to 150 seats and continuance of recognition of 100 MBBS seats.

We reached the institute on 21.04.2016 at 10.20 am. Principal came to the administrative block and received the appointment letter, schedule of inspection process and Annexures check list at 10.40 AM.

She took us in her office at the academic building. Dr. Jayalal started to visit the Surgery & allied wards, OTs, OBGY and LR with Medical Superintendent.

As per direction of Principal Dr. Gupta, Professor of Anatomy accompanied me to hospital visit for Medicine & allied wards. Dr. Mohanty was engaged to take attendance of faculties and resident doctors in college lecture theatre till 11.30 a.m.

During my hospital visit Dr. Mohanty called me to LT for some problems. Immediately from central clinical laboratories I went to LT. No photographers were provided during hospital visit with us. So we took photographs by our own mobile camera.

In the LT management persons who are also faculties of different departments were present there. They asked me about the process of inspection whether it is right or wrong. Took photograph of me in personal mobile of his and recorded. Blamed us that MCI officials screwed us and fought us before sending their institution. Conversation between me and MCI officials recorded by them. Attendance part was going on till 12.40 p.m.

Then we visited college side also and after lunch around 3.30 pm during physical verification of faculties and resident doctors in a big conference hall in administrative block same interference of management persons continued.

In every steps their hot conversation and interference disturbed us to continue the inspection process.

Few parts of college and hospital side could not verified by us for these disturbances. They called the news channel.

In every step we were humiliated, insulted and disturbed. All verified declaration forms except few from surgery department was with us which we

sent to Council. Rest of the declaration forms are kept with the college authority.

On 21.04.2016 around 9 pm when we left the college no annexures as per check list were submitted to us except library documents, central research lab documents which were provided me during visit to respective area. No SA-I & B forms provided to us on 21.04.2016.

After returning to hotel at Jaipur we decided to avoid the institute on 22.04.2016 because we did not want to face further same or more severe incidences. We all were mentally severe depressed and insulted in every step. Hence, we could not visit the college on 2<sup>nd</sup> day i.e. 22.04.2016.

During hospital visit or college visit they did not provide any videographers. But in LT during attendance & during physical verification process the photographers/videographers taken photos of the process.

This is for your kind information.

Sd/-  
(Dr. Karabi Baral)

Sd/-  
(Dr. S. Mohanty)

Sd/-  
(Dr. J.A. Jayalal)

In view of above and as the Institute is repeatedly not allowing assessments to be completed, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the General Body for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NIMS University, Jaipur in respect of students being trained at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur u/s 19 of Indian Medical Council Act.

**45. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Medicit Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur.**

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Medicit Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (03.08.2016) along with previous assessment report (02.03.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Bed occupancy was 69.90% on day of assessment.
2. ICUs: Occupancy in ICCU, SICU was only 2 in each.
3. There was NIL patient in O.T. at time of taking round. Data of 18 Major operations given by the institute is exaggerated.
4. Data of Minor operations as 37 given by the institute is exaggerated. There was NIL Minor operation observed on day of assessment.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision regarding apply of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016 which reads as under:-

8(3)(1).....

(c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from



such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.”

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956, along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance of rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

**46. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.**

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (04.08.2016) along with previous assessment report (05.04.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 12.79 % as detailed in the report.
2. In Obstetrics & Gynecology department, antenatal, postnatal, postoperative, Gynecological operated and non-operated patients were all admitted in the same room. There are no separate antenatal, postnatal, postoperative Gynaecological wards.
3. In Orthopaedics wards, it was observed that review cases and post-operative cases were declared as discharged. Cases operated for Major operations like Lap cholecystectomy were declared as discharged the very next day.
4. The consent forms of operated patients were signed in English in Capital letters and USG reports were similar for many patients. Many admitted patients were having only Ulcers and Wounds. In Surgery, Orthopaedics& ENT wards, admissions were more on the day of assessment and the previous day. There were many patients of abscesses admitted in the wards.
5. In Paediatrics wards, overwriting was seen in the admission register.
6. In ENT, Paediatrics& General Surgery post-operative wards, there was overwriting of the admission registers, especially date of admission on day of assessment and previous day.
7. As per records submitted by Medical Superintendent, there was NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
8. OPD: Diagnosis of patients is not mentioned in OPD register.
9. Casualty: There were 7 patients at 10:00 a.m. By 12:45 p.m. the number of patients had swelled upto 38. None of patients admitted in 10:00 a.m. & 12:45 p.m. merit admission. Date of admission is not mentioned either

- in OPD record or in the case sheet. Data of Casualty attendance provided by institute are inflated.
10. There was mismatch between signs, diagnosis and treatment. One patient was afebrile but provisional diagnosis was made of ? Acute febrile illness, etc.
  11. No treatment was mentioned in OPD record or Case sheet; however, nurses treatment mentioned injectable given. Doctors' treatment chart did not mention dosage to be given.
  12. There is only 1 Casualty Medical Officer doing duty on all days without any break from 8 a.m. to 9 p.m. There was no CMO for night duty.
  13. Names of Nursing staff did not match with duty roster. Proper duty roster for Nursing staff is not maintained. At time of visit to Casualty, Nursing staff were seen shifting drug trolleys to wards. The drug trolleys were empty.
  14. ICUs: There was only 1 patient needing ICCU care was found. Rest of beds were empty. Cases kept for observation and conservatively managed abdominal trauma cases, cellulitis cases with sepsis were seen in ICUs.
  15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 & amended on 18.03.2016 and to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

47. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedhi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedhi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (20<sup>th</sup> & 21<sup>st</sup> July, 2016) carried out in pursuance of the Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016 as well as letter dated 01/08/2016 received from the college authorities. The Committee also perused the letter from assessors dt. 20/07/2016 which reads as under:

*"10.00 a.m. - We reached college at 10 a.m. Dean was not available in Dean's Chamber. No staff was present in Administrative office. Co-coordinator waited in Dean's office and the person from the management was informed to call all the teaching staff and residents for attendance, except the staff who were washed up in OT, labour ward and casualty.*

*10.25 a.m. - Dean arrived after about 15 minutes and was informed regarding attendance of the faculty and residents once again. She was also informed to make arrangements for computer with internet and printer facility and to keep ready Form-A, Form-B of all the Departments, Annexure as per requirements Form-A of Birth and Death records. Dean was shown MCI order for assessment on cell phone while printer arrangement was awaited.*



10.10 a.m. – One of the Assessor visited the facilities on the ground floor and found that the OPD registration counter, waiting area, OPD consultation rooms had no patients, only in OBG OPD three doctor's were present who stated they had not seen any patient since morning. Then in OT complex no surgery was on, OT list was not available of any day in July, 2016. In casualty no doctors were present, there were only 16 beds, 3 patients were there. There was no separate OBG casualty. Staff in OT and wards were said that they were instructed by management not sign any evidence sheets (photos and videos enclosed.)

In the pharmacy no records of any day were available (either manual or computerized). No documents was available regarding distribution of drugs to OP/IP patients.

10.10 a.m. – At the same time, other Assessor went to first floor to visit wards. In OBGY, there were no patient and no delivery in the month of July, 2016. In ENT ward (female) only one patient has ENT complaint, rest were having back ache/pain abdomen. There was no separate female surgical ward, none of the patients genuine verification they had no surgical complaints, not even one patient had any dressing or operative sign. Two patients in surgery were in bed without any case sheets. ICU, ICCU & SICU were not separate and there was only one patient of diarrhea in ICU. There were no patients in NICU/PICU and ventilators not available.

10.25 a.m. – Attendance of faculty and residents was started and all those who came till 11.00 a.m. and signed their attendance, then left for their departments.

11.00 a.m. – All faculty and residents who came after 11 a.m. were asked to sign and put the time in their own hand writing. This continued till 11.50 a.m.

11.50 a.m. – All three Assessors left for visit to various deptts. There was no attendance register of faculty or Biometric attendance. There was no duty roaster. Blood Bank - No blood was issued since 8<sup>th</sup> July, 2016. There were five units of whole blood and there was no facility for component separation. During visits to the Deptt. of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry, Pharmacology, Pathology, Microbiology and Forensic Medicine, faculty rooms were small and congested.

MRD – There was only one computer operator available and three computers. All patients in surgery ward were stated to be on IV medication as per case sheet but not even one patient had received either oral or IV medication since admission, case sheets did not have date of admission/name of doctor or deptt. Needle and syringe disposal facility was not available in any wards. In casualty no entry was made between 6<sup>th</sup> July and 17<sup>th</sup> July, 2016. Patients when asked told the Assessor that they were all brought in three buses from their homes predominantly from Indrapura around 11.30 a.m.

12.50 noon – After repeated requests printer was made available, only then we were able to give the hard copy of MCI order for assessment and UG check list. Labs investigations were less (evidence sheet enclosed).

2.00 p.m. – Verification of declaration forms was started. Owing verification to check the residence proof of a senior Resident of ENT Deptt. , the Assessor was accompanied by the SR and 20 people from management side, not even one person from college, Assessor (Dr.Pallavi Saple) was constantly verbally abused and noticed along the way. There was no mess facility in the resident hostel. Residents accommodation list provide and their actual occupance did not mark. The library had no records after December, 2015. Books available in the Deptt. Library are less. There was no internet facility available. There were only sin demo rooms in the hospital. No patient was admitted for more than one day.

3.00 p.m. – Management people, particularly the Chairman's son and CEO had been interfering in the process of assessment of all three Assessors since morning. They were pressing staff to state things as per their orders and were putting word in their mouth. Despite repeated requests to the Dean, they were not moving away from the assessment. Realizing that the assessment report may not be favourable to them, the management people now took on abusive

and obsessive stand. Chairman's son started threatening the Assessors. He yelled that he will get the permission through Court and higher powers. Threats and abusive in continued and Dean did nothing to stop this wrong doing. Fearing our safety we picked up our assessment material and started moving towards our vehicle. We were unable to enter the vehicle as mob of around 150 surrounded us, most of them did not appeared to faculty/residents/students when we could manage to enter the vehicle, the mob surrounded the vehicle and continued abusing. We called for the Dean to come down, we asked her if she would help us in carrying out the assessment but she also appeared to be under the instructions of the management and she gave us no guarantee of our safety and the further assessment. So, we were forced to abandon the assessment for our safety. While returning to the hotel we noted one red Santro car followed us and when we stopped for tea, one of the Assessors sighted management people including Chairman's son in the car.

Additional information

- There were 280 beds available in the hospital against the required 300 beds.
- Bed occupancy at the time of assessment in 30.33% i.e. 91 out of 300 or 32.50% i.e. 91 out of 280 beds.
- Faculty deficiency was 59% i.e. 59 out of 100.
- Resident deficiency was 93.87% i.e. 46 out of 49.
- Even if all those who signed after 11 a.m. and assuming all residents stay in campus were included, even then.
- Faculty deficiency would have been 45% i.e. 45 out of 100.
- Resident deficiency would have been 46.1% i.e. 23 out of 49.

9.30 a.m. – Receiving no further intimation regarding guarantee of our safety and further assessment from the Dean, we choose to leave Bhopal and proceeded to MCI office to brief the untoward happenings.

11.13 a.m. – Received remarks from the Dean through SMS which appears to have been sent after confirming that we have left Bhopal.”

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

**48. Extension of services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).**

Read: the matter with regard to extension of services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell) for a further period of six months.

**49. Request for change of name of the affiliating University from M.P. Medical Science University, Jabalpur to Malwanchal University, Indore from 2015-16 batch in respect of students being trained at Index Medical College H & RC, Indore.**

Read: the matter with regard to request for change of name of the affiliating University from M.P. Medical Science University, Jabalpur to Malwanchal University, Indore from 2015-16 batch in respect of students being trained at Index Medical College H & RC, Indore.

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the students are admitted under a particular University, upto the stage of

passing III MBBS Part II examination, they remain in that University. Hence such a request cannot be entertained and the question of seeking views of MP Medical Sciences University does not arise. Students can be admitted under Malwanchal University only from 2016-2017 batch.

**50. Formation of Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.).**

Read: the matter with regard to Formation of Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.).

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 13.07.2016 received from the Vice Chancellor, Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah informing about formation of "*Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah*" (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.)

**51. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 recommending removal of name of Dr. B.S. Tomar, Chairman, National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur from the Indian Medical Register for a period of 05 years.

**52. Digital Mission Mode Project (DMMP-MCI) by Medical Council of India.**

Read: the matter with regard to Digital Mission Mode Project (DMMP-MCI) by Medical Council of India.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the status of DMMP project and approved the minutes of the meeting with State Medical Council representatives held in the Council Office on 19.08.2016.

**53. Minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.**

Read: the minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.

**Dr. Reena Nayyar recused herself from the meeting.**

**54. Review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.30 a.m.**

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (Under Suspension).



The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 17/09/2016.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**55. Review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.45 a.m.**

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 24/09/2016.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**56. Review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.15 a.m.**

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 20/09/2016.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

**Dr. Reena Nayyar rejoined the meeting.**

**57. International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA)- Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.**

Read: the matter with regard to International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA)- Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the contents of an email received from International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA) requesting Dr. Jayshree Mehta, President, MCI to attend the 12<sup>th</sup> Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the decision of the President nominating Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c to accompany her to attend the International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA) Conference.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

58. **Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150/200/250 MBBS admissions – Amendments in the Equipment List regarding.**

Read : the revised Equipment List submitted by the Sub-Committee for amendment in the Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150/200/250 MBBS admissions.

The Executive Committee considered the revised Equipment List submitted by the Sub-Committee and decided to approve the same.

***The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.***

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

New Delhi, dated  
23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2016

(Dr. Reena Nayyar)  
Secretary I/c

**APPROVED**

(Dr. Jayshree Mehta)  
President

