

No.MCI-5(3)/2003-Med./

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on Monday, the 5th May, 2003 at 12.00 noon in the Council office at New Delhi where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002 were also present.

** ** *

Present:

Dr. P.C.Kesavankutty Nayar - President (Acting)
Prof. P.N. Tandon] Adhoc Committee
Dr.(Mrs.) S. Kantha] Members
Dr. K.S. Chugh
Dr. F.U. Ahmed
Dr. Ajay Kumar
Dr. D.K. Sharma
Dr. Mukesh Kr. Sharma
Dr. B.P. Dubey
Dr. V.K. Puri
Dr. P.M. Jadhav
Dr. Nitin S. Vora

Dr. K.K. Arora - Joint Secretary

Apology for non-attendance was received from Prof. N. Rangabashyam, one of the members of the Adhoc Committee.

Before the start of the meeting, the President (Acting) and the members of the Adhoc Committee & Executive Committee expressed their gratitude and thanks for the services rendered by the outgoing Secretary Dr.(Mrs.) M. Sachdeva who on her superannuation retired in the afternoon of 30.4.2003.

1. Minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 19.4.2003 – Confirmation of.

The minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 19.04.2003 were confirmed.

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted the action taken by the office on the various items included in the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 19.04.2003 with following modifications:-

1. Page No. 12, point C which reads as under:-

“students who are admitted pursuant to the order dated 3.12.2002 shall be permitted to pursue their studies in the respective college. In pursuance of the above Court orders inspection of both the medical colleges has been arranged to be carried out on 3rd May,2003. File has been sent to the Council Advocate, for his opinion.”

Against the lines reading as “In pursuanceopinion”, the action taken be read as “The inspection of both the medical colleges has been carried out on 03.05.2003 and the report is being placed before the Executive Committee”.

2. Page No. 12 item No. 13 – **“To consider the matter with regard to carrying out inspection of medical college at Valia, Gujarat for admission of 2nd^batch of students for the academic session 2003-2004”**

The action taken against the last paragraph reading as “The Committee.....single piece” was recorded as ‘noted’.

The action taken against this paragraph be read corrected as “Letters to that effect be written to the Central Govt. so also to the authorities in the State Govt.”

3. Page No. 14, item No. 16 **“To consider the letter received from the Executive President & Managing Trustee, MAMER MIMER Medical College, Talegaon in response to the decision taken by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 13.3.2003 with regard to approval of the college”.**

The action taken against the last paragraph reading as “In light of.....receipt of the opinion” it was recorded that “File sent on 30.4.2003 to Council Advocate for obtaining legal opinion”.

The action taken be read corrected as under:-

“The authorities of the college submitted the compliance report stating therein that they have signed a memorandum of understanding and that the lease stands transferred in the name of the college/trust and the lease deed is in the process of registration. The file along with the above communication received from the college was sent to the Council Advocate and the opinion has been obtained in the morning which is being placed before the Committee for its consideration.”

4. Page No. 18 & 19, item No. 20 **“Medical Education – Establishment of Medical Colleges in Private Sector in the State – certain amendments to Medical Council of India Regulations, 1999 – requested – regarding”.**

Item No. 21 – **“Enhancement of the maximum marks in some of the subjects of MBBS course – Recommendations of Academic**

Senate – Request received from the Registrar, NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada – Reg.”

Item No. 22 – “Increasing the duration of the first phase of MBBS to 1 ½ years – Recommendation of Academic Senate – Request received from the Registrar, NTR University of Health Sciences”.

The action taken on the above matters be read corrected as “Noted for action for placing the same before the proposed Sub-Committee as decided by the General Body at its meeting held on 24.3.2003”.

5. Page No. 33 & 34, item No. 42 **“To consider the letter of Prof. N. Rangabashyam regarding carrying out the inspection of the P.G. courses”.**

Page No. 34 the action taken against the paragraph reading as “Prof.N. Rangabashyam.....informed accordingly” it was recorded that “Noted and the Doctors will be informed accordingly”, wherein it was pointed out that it will not be advisable to inform the concerned doctors regarding non-inclusion of their names in the list of Panel of Inspectors. At this point of time the President read out letters from Prof. N.Rangabashyam one dated 16.4.2003 and two letters dated 25.4.2003 wherein he has brought out that “I am really surprised by the inspection report of Santosh Medical College and Hospital, Ghaziabad. Each one of them have recommended 7 seats without mentioning the nature of illness (whether they needed admission) and the type of treatment given. One wonders, whether they have enough clinical materials for 7 postgraduate students in each department. By going through the file, there is no mention about the clinical materials particularly in the orthopaedic department, where only 2 trauma cases and rest were admitted with back pain. In view of this, I feel a surprise check has to be done on this college and one of the inspectors should be from the Adhoc Committee. I also request that when we send inspectors, it is not necessary that all of them should be from the same city and inspectors from other states also can be part of the team. Being these reports were flowery and over-recommended, I feel the list of inspectors called for Ghaziabad should not be called anymore”.

The Executive Committee; after knowing that the action on the minutes of the Postgraduate Committee meeting held on 17.04.2003 since has not been taken; decided that the observations of Prof. N. Rangabashyam be considered at the ensuing meeting of the Postgraduate Committee before communicating any decision/action being taken with regard to permission/continuation of seats for postgraduate courses at Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.

The other two letters dated 25.4.2003 pertaining to his suggestion that 4 doctors namely Dr. S.N.Motilal, Orthopaedician, Chennai Dr. Saravanan, Radiologist, Chennai, Dr. Geetha Lakshmipathy, Neurologist, Chennai and Dr. R. Rajendran, Anaesthesiologist, Chennai need not be called for inspection because of lack of experience independently, the Executive Committee while confirming

the minutes of the EC dated 19.04.2003 had observed that Prof. Rangabashyam in the last meeting has recommended to delete the following 7 names which were proposed by him for inclusion in the panel of inspectors :-

1. Dr. S.N. Motilal, Chennai.
2. Dr. P.M. Hari, Chennai
3. Dr. K.C. Saravanan, Chennai
4. Dr. Geetha Lakshmipathy, Chennai
5. Dr. R. Rajendran, Chennai
6. Dr. N. Chakravarthi, Chennai
7. Dr. Sudha Seshaiyam, Chennai.

The minutes so circulated were approved by Prof. N. Rangabashyam vide his letter dated 25.4.2003. While approving the minutes, in the same letter, he has informed the Acting President to delete only the following 4 names from the panel of inspectors:-

1. Dr. Motilal, Orthopaedician, Chennai
2. Dr. Saravanan, Radiologist, Chennai
3. Dr. Geetha Lakshmipathy, Neurologist, Chennai
4. Dr. R. Rajendran, Anaesthesiologist, Chennai

In view of this dichotomy, the Executive Committee decided to clarify from Prof. Rangabashyam regarding the deletion of remaining 3 names from the panel of inspectors which has been suggested by him in the meeting.

On page No. 35 the paragraph reading as “The Executive Committee.....held immediately” it was mentioned that “Recommendations of the Executive Committee with regard to revision of salary of Regional Inspectors will be placed before the General Body for approval”. The word ‘approval’ be replaced by the word ‘ratification’.

6. Page No. 36, item No. 43 **“Inclusion of record of research in the proforma of inspection – Regarding”**

Dr. Ajay Kumar stated that a meeting of the associated organisations/departments i.e. ICMR, NBE, NAMS, Department of Science & Technology including Ministry of Health, DGHS etc. be called in the month of June,2003 and the first zonal workshop should be held in July,03.

The members requested Prof. P.N. Tandon, Member, Adhoc Committee to prepare the draft guidelines.

3. Increase of MBBS seats from 110 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Coimbatore, u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (22nd & 23rd April, 2003) for increase of MBBS seats from 110 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Coimbatore.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (22nd & 23rd April, 2003) and noted that the college is running following postgraduate courses with number of seats mentioned against each:-

M.D.(General Medicine)	-	14
M.D.(Obst. & Gynae.)	-	02
M.S.(General Surgery)	-	15
M.Ch.(Paediatric Surgery)	-	02
D.G.O.	-	06
D.C.H.	-	04
D.A.	-	03

The Committee was of the view that the number admitted in various postgraduate courses appears to be more than what is permissible as per the Council regulations.

The Committee was of the opinion that this matter be referred to the Postgraduate Committee for its consideration and necessary action.

The Committee further noted the following deficiencies:-

1. Shortage of staff:

Professor – 1 (Obst. & Gynae.)

Associate Professor – 1 (Anatomy)

Assistant Professor – 5 (Statistician cum Lecturer –1, M.O. cum Lecturer at UHC –1, TB & Chest –1, Surg. –1 & Radio-diagnosis –1)

Tutor/Sr. Resident – 2 (Radio-diagnosis)

Jr. Resident – 13 (TB & Chest-2, Psychiatry-3, Orthopaedics-3, Ophthalmology-3, ENT -2)

Faculty shortage – 7.14%

Tutor/Residents shortage – 12.71%

Dr. R. Aaron who has been shown as Associate Professor of Anatomy can only be considered as Assistant Professor as he is MBBS, M.Sc. (Non-medical) and does not have either Ph.D. required for non-medical or M.S. required for medical person to be promoted to Associate Professor.

Dr. (Ms.) R. Chitra who has been shown as Associate Professor of Biochemistry can be considered as Assistant Professor only as she has only 3 yrs. 8 months experience as Assistant Professor.

Dr. (Ms.) R.B. Kamalam who has been shown as Professor of Obst. & Gynae. can only be considered as Associate Professor as she has only 3 yrs. 6 months experience as Associate Professor.

2. As the hospital campus is 8 kms. away from the college, 1 gallery type lecture theatre needs to be constructed for lectures of clinical departments in the hospital campus.
3. In emergency though 24 observation beds have been provided in a separate area which is located away, no emergency or resuscitation equipment has been provided in the observation area.
4. Separate CSSD is not available. It is in the main O.T. complex adjacent to O.T. It works for 12 hours. A separate CSSD with more equipment and 24 hours running needs to be established.
5. Medical records are not computerised.
6. Residents' quarters and nurses' quarters within the campus are not provided as per norms.
7. The number of Indian journals in the central library needs to be increased. Library facilities in the hospital campus also need to be expanded.
8. Examination hall of adequate capacity is not available. Tables & chairs are also not provided.
9. Mortuary block needs to be provided with a viewing gallery.
10. Teaching and outreach activities at R.H.T.C./U.H.C. need to be organised by the PSM department on a regular basis. Persons holding M.D.(PSM) qualifications should be posted as M.O.cum Lecturer at these centres.
11. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Intent (LOI) for increase of MBBS seats from 110 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Coimbatore u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

4. Increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Chengalpattu, u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (24th & 25th April, 2003) for increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Chengalpattu.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the Council Inspectors' report (24th & 25th April,2003) and noted that the college is admitting 52 students per year specifically in the year

2002-03 as mentioned in the inspection report and also that the college has admitted only 3 students in the open category and 7 from the merit of All India Entrance Examination and rest of the students have been admitted against the reserved category. Though the Committee is sensitive to the needs of the society and the reserved category of candidates, yet the admissions made by the college mainly in the reserved category is against the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court wherein not more than 50% reservation is allowed.

The Committee in the first place decided to obtain from the authorities of college the list of candidates admitted in the year 2002-03 in order of merit so as to identify and take action as provided u/s 10B of the I.M.C. Act,1956 against the excess admissions made therein.

The Committee also decided to form a Sub-Committee consisting of the following members to go into the details of admission criteria with specific terms of reference i.e. (i) the complete details of admission policy being followed in the State of Tamil Nadu; (ii) the admission policy with respect to reservations in the State of Tamil Nadu; (iii) statistical data with respect to total admissions made in each of the medical colleges merit, category & year-wise in the State of Tamil Nadu for the last five years:-

1. Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham, Vice-Chancellor, Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai
2. Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad, Whole-time Inspector, MCI
3. Professor N. Rangabashyam, Member, Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002.

The Committee decided to request the members of the Sub-Committee to submit their report at their earliest convenience so as to enable the office to place the same before the ensuing meeting of the Executive Committee.

On going through the inspection report, the Committee also noted the following deficiencies:-

1. Shortage of staff:

Associate Professor – 1 (Psychiatry)

Assistant Professor – 7 (Statistician cum Lecturer –1, M.O. cum Lecturer at RHTC-1, M.O. cum Lecturer at UHC –1, TB & Chest –1, Psychiatry –1, Antenatal M.O. cum Lecturer –1 & M.C.W.O. cum Lecturer –1)

Pharmaceutical Chemist – 1

Tutor/Sr. Resident – 4 (L.M.O. at U.H.C.-1, TB & Chest –1, Radio-diagnosis-1)

Jr. Resident – 22 (Paediatrics –2, TB & Chest-3, Skin & V.D.-2, Psychiatry-3, Orthopaedics –5, Ophthalmology-2,

Faculty shortage - 10.84%
Tutor/Residents shortage – 26.53%

2 Associate Professors joined the college within last three months.

1 – Associate Professor and 1 – Assistant Professor has left the institution within last three months.

2. The capacity of available generator in the college campus needs to be augmented.
3. The space between two beds is too less in some wards.
4. Central O₂ or central suction are not available in emergency. Observation area is located at a distance from emergency area and no resuscitation/ monitoring equipment is available in that area.
5. ICCU, separate ICUs as prescribed under the norms and dialysis unit need to be set up with proper monitoring, resuscitation and treatment equipment.
6. Central laundry is not mechanised.
7. Residents quarters and nurses' hostel are not provided as per Council norms.
8. Auditorium is not available.
9. Mortuary block with proper cold storage cabinet and viewing gallery for students needs to be provided.
10. Rural Health Training Centres (RHTC)/Urban Health Centre (UHC) need to be developed with proper staffing and facilities as per the norms.
11. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Intent (LOI) for increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Chengalpattu u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

5. Mahatama Gandhi National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur – Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (24th & 25th April, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students at Mahatama Gandhi National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (24th & 25th April,2003) and

decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of 100 students at Mahatma Gandhi National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur for the academic session 2003-04.”

6. Accreditation of the Medical Degree Programme.

Read : The report of the task force on the accreditation of the Medical Degree Programme held on 17/04/2003.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted the report submitted by the Sub-Committee and decided to have more details from the Sub-Committee and also decided to defer the item for consideration by the next meeting of the Executive Committee and also decided to invite the Chairman of the Sub-Committee as a “Special Invitee”.

7. To note the Letter of Intent/Renewal of permission for establishment of medical college.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted the letter of Intent/Renewal of permission for establishment of medical college issued by the Central Government as under:-

Name of the Medical College	Date of LOI/renewal of permission by the Central Govt.
Establishment of Jubilee Mission Medical College, & Research Institute at Trissur, Kerala.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 16/4/2003 issued Letter of Intent for 100 students for the academic session 2003-2004.
Establishment of GSL Medical College at Venkatapuram, Rajahmundry by GSL Educational Society, Rajahmundry.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 16/4/2003 issued Letter of Intent for 150 students for the academic session 2003-2004.
Vinayaka Mission’s Medical College, Karaikal Pondicherry.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 6 th batch of 100 students for the academic session 2002-2003 issued by the Central Govt. on 16.4.2003.
Medical College at Nellore by Narayna Education Society, Nellore.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 students for the academic session 2003-2004 issued by the Central Govt. on 17.4.2003.
Kamineni Instt. of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda District, Andhra Pradesh.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 students for the academic session

	2003-2004 issued by the Central Govt. on 17.4.2003.
K.S. Hegde Medical Academy at Mangalore by NITTE Educational Trust, Mangalore.	As per recommendations of the Executive Committee Letter of renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 students for the academic session 2003-2004 issued by the Central Govt. on 16.4.2003.

8. Construction of Medical Council Building at Dwarka : Extension in time for completion of work by M/s. L & T.

Read : The matter with regard to grant of extension of time for completion for the work by M/s. L & T for construction of Medical Council Building at Dwarka.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee heard the observations made by the Chairman, Building Committee which is also a member of the Executive Committee and decided to allow additional time upto 15th June,2003 to M/s L & T for completing the pending work without any escalation.

9. Removal of Name of deceased person from Indian Medical Register.

Read : The letter dated 16/04/2003 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council intimating that Dr. Hans Kumar, registered with that Council under registration no. 564, dated 30/06/1961, has expired on 11/04/2003 and his name has been erased from the Registered Medical Practitioners.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted from the letter dated 16.04.2003 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council that the State Council has erased the name of Dr. Hans Kumar from the register of Registered Medical Practitioners maintained by the Rajasthan Medical Council only on the basis of an information published in the local newspaper on 11.4.2003 about his sad demise. While appreciating that the Rajasthan Medical Council has been prompt enough in furnishing the information of removal of name of doctors from their register, the Committee decided to obtain verification and confirmation from the Rajasthan Medical Council as to how they have removed the name of Dr. Hans Kumar only on the information about his demise published in the local paper.

10. Khaja Banda Nawaj Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga – Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (03/05/2003) of Khaja Banda Nawaj Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga, carried out in compliance of the

order dated 16/04/2003 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka at Bangalore.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted that inspection for renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students at Khaja Banda Nawaj Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga was carried out by the council Inspectors on 22nd & 23rd August, 2002 and the Inspection report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 09/09/2002. In view of the various deficiencies pointed out in the Inspection report, the Committee did not recommend to renew the permission for the 2nd batch during 2002-2003.

On receipt of the compliance on the deficiencies pointed out in the above inspection report through the Central Govt. another inspection to verify the same was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 8th & 9th Nov., 2002. The compliance verification inspection report along with the Court order dated 03/12/2002 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka in W.P. No. 39779/2002 filed by the Khaja Education Society & Ors. Vs. Union of India and the Medical Council of India was considered by the Executive Committee where the members of the Adhoc-Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20/11/2002 were also present at its meeting held on 09/01/2003. In view of the deficiencies detected in the compliance verification inspection report renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch was again not recommended. The recommendations of the Executive Committee where the members of the Adhoc-Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20/11/2002 were also present were communicated to the Central Govt. vide MCI letter dated 14/01/2003. As per the Court order the Central Govt. on consideration of the recommendation of the Medical Council of India would have to grant the renewal of permission if the petitioner institution satisfied all the legal requirement within **seven days** from the date of receipt of such recommendations.

The students were admitted in the above medical college in pursuance of the interim order passed by the Hon'ble High Court. The Court had further directed that in the event of the petitioner failing to obtain the necessary permission from the Central Govt. u/s 10A **this order will not aid any equities** in favour of the petitioners institutions for those students who were admitted in pursuance to the interim order passed by the court.

No communication has been received from the Central Govt. on the decision of the Executive Committee where the members of the Adhoc-Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20/11/2002 were also present communicated to it on 14/01/2003 in spite of reminders sent on 19/02/2003, 11/03/2003, 26/03/2003 and 01/05/2003.

Now the office of the Council has received an order dated 16/04/2003, passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka in W.P. No. 39772/2002. The operative part of which is as under :

- a. The deficiencies pointed out by the MCI while they had inspected these two institutions are said to have been rectified.

Therefore it is necessary for the MCI to inspect the institutions over again to verify whether the deficiencies pointed out by them earlier have been rectified as the Central Govt. has not yet passed any order on the recommendations of the MCI.

b. The said exercise shall be conducted by the MCI within a period of **twenty days** from today. There after they shall submit their recommendations to the Central Govt. for further orders.

On receipt of the said recommendations, the Central Govt. pass appropriate orders within a period of **2 weeks**. In the meanwhile, the directions issued by the order dt. 3.12.2002 shall be in operation till the aforesaid steps are taken.

c. Students who are admitted pursuant to the order dt. 3.12.2002 shall be permitted to pursue their studies in the respective college.

In compliance of the above order passed by the Hon'ble High court of Karnataka, inspection of Khaja Banda Nawaj Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 3rd May, 2003. On going through the inspection report, the Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted the following:-

1. OPD is still functioning in the old block. As per the assurance given by the management, it ought to have been shifted by the end of academic year 2002-2003 to the new building. The construction activity in the new building is yet to be completed and would take a few months. Total number of new cases on the day of inspection were only 209 as against the requirement of 600 per day as per the records checked by the inspection team. The numbers were missing in the outpatient register maintained separately for males & females.

There are no cubicles in Surgical, Medical or Obstetric & Gynaecological OPD. Orthopaedic OPD does not have any examination room. Fans are not provided in the examination room and teaching areas. OPD facilities and teaching areas need to be provided with proper examination tray, X-ray viewing lobby, etc.

2. In casualty out of 20 beds available only 4 beds were occupied on the day of inspection. Only 1 defibrillator & 1 ECG machine are available. There are no toilet facilities. Casualty area needs to be reorganized with proper resuscitation and monitoring equipments.

3. In wards medical units are not clearly demarcated. Teaching areas are not provided with fans, patient couches, X-ray view boxes or wash basins in many wards. No microscopes are available in side laboratories of some of the wards. Septic labour room should be provided with fan & x-ray view box. Plastering room is not available in Orthopaedic ward.

4. Clinical material is grossly inadequate, the bed occupancy on the day of inspection was 47.50 as against the requirement of 80%. The

number of surgeries performed and the deliveries conducted are too low for a hospital which is functioning as a teaching institution for 3 years. The institution does not have C.T. Scan, histopathology & Cytopathology which needs to be provided.

5. The blood bank is not functional as also reported in the earlier inspection reports.
6. No additional machine has been installed for X-ray. Radiographer is not using BARC indicator. No request has been made to BARC for inspection.
7. There is no Central oxygen supply in the existing hospital.
8. No register is maintained in CSSD.
9. Incinerator is not available.
10. In the Central Kitchen no dietician is available. The cooking and preparation areas are unhygienic.
11. Only few rooms are occupied for the Resident doctors Hostel. As per regulations of the Council there should be a residence Doctors Hostel where the resident doctors should be staying.
12. Agreement for only one rural health centre viz Farathabad has been made with the Government.
13. Deficiency of Staff:-
 - i/ Faculty:- 10.34% (9 out of 87)
 - ii/ Associate Prof. : 3 (Physiology:1, Orthopaedics:1,Dentistry:1)
 - iii/ Assistant Professor : 6 (Physiology:1, Pharmaceutical Chemist:1, MO cum Lecturer at RHTC :1, M.O. cum Lecturer at U.H.C.:1, Radiodiagnosis:1, Dentistry:1)
 - iv/ Tutor/Sr. Resident: 30% (33 out of 110)
 - v/ Tutor/Sr. Resident:7 (Anatomy:2, Pharmacology:2, Pathology:1, PSM:1, Surgery:1)
 - vi/ Jr. Resident: 26 (Medicine:6, Paediatrics:3, Skin & V.D.:2, Psychiatry:2, Surgery:8, Orthopaedics:3, ENT:1, Obstetrics & Gynaecology:1)
14. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee and the members of the Adhoc Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of students at Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, for the academic session 2002-2003.

11. Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga – Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (03/05/2003) of Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga carried out in compliance of the order dated 16/04/2003, passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka at Bangalore.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee noted that inspection for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students during 2002-2003 was carried out by the Council Inspectors of 4th and 5th June 2002 and the inspection report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 24th June 2002. In view of the various deficiencies pointed out in the Inspection report the Executive Committee did not recommend to renew the permission.

On receipt of compliance through the Central Govt. on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report another inspection to verify the same was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 11th and 12th October 2002. The Executive Committee at its meeting held on 31st Oct., 2002 in view of the deficiencies pointed out in the compliance verification report again not recommended for renewal of permission.

Compliance as received was again verified by the Council Inspectors on 24th December 2002. The compliance verification inspection report along with the order dated 03/12/2002 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka at Bangalore in W.P. No.42277/2002 Murugarajendra Vidyapeetha, Chitradurga Vs. UOI & Ors. was considered by the Executive Committee where the members of the Adhoc-Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20/11/2002 were also present at its meeting held on 09/01/2003, where the renewal of permission was not recommended in view of the deficiencies pointed out in the Inspection report. The recommendations of the Committee were communicated to the Central Govt. vide MCI letter dated 14/01/2003. As per the Court order the Central Govt. on consideration of the recommendation of the Medical Council of India would have to grant the renewal of permission if the petitioner institution satisfied all the legal requirement within **seven days** from the date of receipt of such recommendation the Central Government.

The students were admitted in the above medical college in pursuance of the interim order passed by the Hon'ble High Court. The Court had further directed that in the event of the petitioner failing to obtain the necessary permission from the Central Govt. u/s 10A **this order will not aid any equities** in favour of the petitioners institutions for those students who were admitted in pursuance of the interim order passed by the court.

No communication has been received from the Central Govt. on the above decision of the Committee communicated to it on 14/01/2003, inspite of reminders sent on 19/02/2003, 11/03/2003, 26/03/2003 and 01/05/2003.

Now the office of the council has received an order dated 16/04/2003, passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Karnataka in W.P. No. 42277/2002. The operative part of which is as under :

A. The deficiencies pointed out by the MCI while they had inspected these two institutions are said to have been rectified. Therefore it is necessary for the MCI to inspect the institutions over again to verify whether the deficiencies pointed out by them earlier have been rectified as the Central Govt. has not yet passed any order on the recommendations of the MCI.

B. The said exercise shall be conducted by the MCI within a period of **twenty days** from today. There after they shall submit their recommendations to the Central Govt. for further orders.

On receipt of the said recommendations, the Central Govt. pass appropriate orders within a period of **2 weeks**. In the meanwhile, the directions issued by the order dt. 3.12.2002 shall be in operation till the aforesaid steps are taken.

C. Students who are admitted pursuant to the order dt. 3.12.2002 shall be permitted to pursue their studies in the respective college.

In compliance of the above order dated 16/4/2003, passed by the Hon'ble High court of Karnataka inspection of Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 3rd May, 2003. On going through the inspection report the Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc-Committee noted the following:-

1. The affiliation for the academic year 2002-03 by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore for admission at Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga is not available.
2. The hospital is owned by separate Private Limited Company and not by the college.
3. Total number of beds available in the hospital are 320 against the requirement of 350. It is clear deficiency of 30 beds.
4. The record keeping in the hospital is not maintained adequately. The registration counter does not have any OPD registration record of number worth the name. Thus the total number of patients attending the OPD could not be verified due to absence of any record at the central registration counter.
5. The reliability of records is of doubt e.g. photocopy of outdoor records of General Surgery are annexed and reported in the inspector's report. It has been observed that the picture is almost similar in all other departments. The irregularities and manipulation in the register of OPD is clearly evident from the papers available. Similar picture is seen in the indoor case sheets.

6. All the case sheets in Paediatric ward were blank.
7. Out of 4 operation theatres only two are functioning. The operation theatre register also shows poor number of surgical operations being performed.
8. From the records available in the District Hospital patients are managed by the District Hospital doctors and not by the teachers of the medical college. There is no facility of Resident Doctors duty room in the District Hospital. Student teaching is carried out 3 days in a week in the hospital but there is no teaching area provided.
9. There is no progress for the construction of residential quarters by the college.
10. There is no improvement in Histopathology, Cytopathology and Microbiology labs utilisation.
11. The institution has already admitted 100 students of which 22 admissions are made under the management quota.
12. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee and the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20/11/2002 decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of students at Basaveshwara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga, for the academic session 2002-2003.

12. Govt. Medical College, Toothukudi - renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (29th & 30th April, 2003) for renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students at Govt. Medical College, Toothukudi.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the Council Inspectors' report (29th & 30th April, 2003) and noted that the college is admitting 100 students as mentioned in the inspection report and also that the college has admitted only 1 student in the open category and rest of the students have been admitted against the reserved categories. Though the Committee is sensitive to the needs of the society and the reserved category of candidates, yet the admissions made by the college mainly in the reserved category is against the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court wherein not more than 50% reservation is allowed.

The Committee also decided to form a Sub-Committee consisting of the following members to go into the details of admission criteria with specific terms of reference i.e. (i) the complete details of admission policy being followed in the State of Tamil Nadu; (ii) the admission policy with respect to reservations in the State of Tamil Nadu; (iii) statistical data with

respect to total admissions made in each of the medical colleges merit, category & year-wise in the State of Tamil Nadu for the last five years.

1. Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham, Vice-Chancellor, Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai
2. Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad, Whole-time Inspector, MCI
3. Professor N. Rangabashyam, Member, Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002.

The Committee decided to request the members of the Sub-Committee to submit their report at their earliest convenience so as to enable the office to place the same before the ensuing meeting of the Executive Committee.

On going through the inspection report, the Committee also noted the following deficiencies:-

1. Shortage of teaching staff:

Faculty : 5.49%

Assistant Professor – 5 (Epidemiologist cum Lecturer-1, M.O. cum Lecturer at RHTC-1, MO cum Lecturer at U.H.C.-1, Antenatal Medical Officer cum Lecturer –1, Maternal & Child Welfare Officer – 1.

Tutor/Residents : 24.35%

Jr. Resident – 28 (Medicine-6, Paediatrics-2, TB & Chest –3, Skin & VD-2, Psychiatry –3, Surgery –4, Orthopaedics-2, Ophthalmology –2, ENT –2, Obst. & Gynae.-2)

3 Associate Professors joined the institution within last three months.

No Junior Residents have been appointed in any clinical department. In some departments, students called ‘Special Trainees’ who pay a fixed monthly fee to attend the hospital to get the experience and the membership of the library are available. No fixed tenure is assigned to any department for any such trainee and they are rotated in multiple departments in a short time frame and they are not postgraduate students of the department.

2. The space between two beds is less in some wards of the hospital which is not conducive for teaching and needs to be rectified.
3. The number of surgeries performed are much less than indicated by the flow of patients. Histopathology, Cytopathology & Microbiology investigations need to be increased.
4. Out of 10 operation theatres, three operation theatres are yet to be commissioned. Resuscitation equipment is not available in O.Ts. Pre operative room with 1 bed and post operative recovery room with only 1 bed are available in Surgical O.T. which is grossly inadequate.

Another ward with 12 beds has been designated as post operative ward which does not have any monitoring or resuscitation equipment. Central O₂ supply and central suction are not available. Many O.Ts. have more than 1 table which needs to be rectified. Post operative recovery room with proper resuscitation equipment needs to be set up.

5. In O.P.D. washing facilities, examination trays, couches & x-ray viewing boxes etc. have not been provided in all the rooms. Clinical demonstration areas provided in each department need to be adequately furnished. O.P.D. case sheet needs to be replaced with bigger and thicker paper.
6. As the hospital campus is away from the college, one gallery type lecture theatre needs to be constructed for lectures of clinical departments in the hospital campus.
7. Emergency O.T. attached to the casualty has direct access from the corridor which needs to be prevented. 20 observation beds as provided are located away. No emergency or resuscitation equipment has been provided in the observation area. Central O₂ or central suction are not available. Casualty set up needs to be reorganised with proper monitoring and resuscitation equipment.
8. Medical records are not computerised.
9. CSSD as available is too small. It needs to be augmented and streamlined with at least two more horizontal bulk sterilizers.
10. Central laundry is not mechanised.
11. Residents quarters and nurses quarters within the campus need to be provided as per norms.
12. The number of books and journals available in the Central library need to be increased as per the norms prescribed. As the hospital campus is 2 ½ kms. away from the college, library facilities in the hospital need to be augmented.
13. Veterinary officer on full time needs to be appointed as per norms.
14. Medical education cell facilities and activities need to be upgraded and strengthened.
15. Teaching & outreach activities at RHTC/UHC need to be organised by the PSM department on a regular basis. Persons holding M.D.(PSM) qualifications should be posted as M.O. cum Lecturer at these centres. Transport facilities also need to be provided for transport of teachers and students.
16. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of students at Govt. Medical College, Toothkudi for the academic session 2003-04.

13. Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Kilpauk u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read : The Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd May, 2003) for increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Kilpauk u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the Council Inspectors' report (1st & 2nd May, 2003) and noted that the college is admitting 102 students per year specifically in the year 2002-03 as mentioned in the inspection report and also that the college has admitted only 14 students in the open category and 14 from the merit of All India Entrance Examination and rest of the students have been admitted against the reserved categories. Though the Committee is sensitive to the needs of the society and the reserved category of candidates, yet the admissions made by the college mainly in the reserved category is against the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court wherein not more than 50% reservation is allowed.

The Committee in the first place decided to obtain from the authorities of college the list of candidates admitted in the year 2002-03 in order of merit so as to identify and take action as provided u/s 10B of the I.M.C. Act, 1956 against the excess admissions made therein.

The Committee decided to form a Sub-Committee consisting of the following members to go into the details of admission criteria with specific terms of reference i.e. (i) the complete details of admission policy being followed in the State of Tamil Nadu; (ii) the admission policy with respect to reservations in the State of Tamil Nadu; (iii) statistical data with respect to total admissions made in each of the medical colleges merit, category & year-wise in the State of Tamil Nadu for the last five years.

1. Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham, Vice-Chancellor, Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai
2. Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad, Whole-time Inspector, MCI
3. Professor N. Rangabashyam, Member, Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002.

The Committee decided to request the members of the Sub-Committee to submit their report at their earliest convenience so as to enable the office to place the same before the ensuing meeting of the Executive Committee.

On going through the inspection report, the Committee also noted the following deficiencies:-

1. Shortage of teaching staff:

Faculty: 5.61%

Associate Professor – 1 (Anatomy-1)

Assistant Professor – 5 (Physiology-2, Statistician cum lecturer-1, M.O.cum Lecturer at U.H.C.-1, M.O. cum Lecturer at RHTC –1)

Tutor/Residents – 4.20%

Junior Resident – 5 (Psychiatry-3, ENT-2)

No Junior Residents have been appointed in any clinical department. In the departments where postgraduate courses are available, the students are assigned duty on rotational basis and the continuous link with the patient is not maintained. In many departments, students called ‘Special Trainees’ who pay a fixed monthly fee to attend the hospital to get the experience and the membership of the library are available. No fixed tenure is assigned to any department for any such trainee and they are rotated in multiple departments in a short time frame and they are not postgraduate students of the department.

2. In the hospital nursing staff is deficient by 23.33%.
3. Unit distribution of beds is not as per Council norms in various departments. The main hospital does not have any ward for tuberculosis and chest diseases which needs to be rectified. Psychiatry beds are not available in any hospital. No separate staff is appointed for non-teaching beds.
4. Histopathology and Cytopathology investigations need to be increased.
5. In the operation theatres resuscitation equipment is not available. Post operative set up needs reorganisation.
6. Obstetric ICU needs to be set up. Paediatric ICU which is in a corridor needs to be reorganised.
7. In OPD waiting space as provided in some of the departments is inadequate and is over crowding. Examination trays, patient couches and x-ray viewing boxes etc. have not been provided in all the rooms. Equipment is not properly maintained. Trial set in the refraction room is broken. Privacy of the patients is not properly maintained. Lighting is inadequate. Clinical demonstration areas as provided are small and not conducive for teaching. OPD case sheet is required to be replaced with thicker paper. OPD set up needs to be reorganised.
8. Departmental OPD register do not contain any details like diagnosis etc. It needs to be computerised and reorganised.
9. In clinical laboratories only routine investigation equipments are available. More equipments need to be provided. The set up of the central laboratory needs to be revamped and augmented.

10. Separate CSSD is not available.
11. Residents' quarters and nurses' quarters are inadequate.
12. Examination hall is poorly lit and ill ventilated. The seating capacity of the examination hall is not as per the MCI norms. It requires to be refurnished and reorganised.
13. Infrastructure as provided in pre clinical department is not adequate for 150 students. In some instances, it is not adequate even for 100 students.
14. Hostel facilities are inadequate even for the present requirements. Chair and cupboard are not available to each inmate. No quarters are available for the teaching staff in the campus.
15. Medical education is poorly equipped and is non-functional. No training courses were organised for the faculty during the previous year.
16. Statistical unit is not established as a separate unit.
17. Teaching & outreach activities at RHTC/UHC need to be organised by the PSM department on a regular basis. Persons holding M.D.(PSM) qualifications should be posted as M.O. cum Lecturer at these centres.
18. Auditorium is not available.
19. Incinerator is not available.
20. Other observations/deficiencies pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee and the members of the Adhoc Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Intent for increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Kilpauk u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

14. Approval of B.J.Medical College, Ahmedabad for the award of MBBS degree granted by Gujarat University for the increased number of seats from 210 to 250.

Read: The letter No.2/UG/MCI/inspection/11048-52/2003 dated 10.4.2003 furnishing compliance/remarks on the deficiencies and letter No. 2/UG/MCI/inspection/12401-05/2003 dated 2.5.2003 in connection with tabulated compliance report on the deficiencies received from the Dean, B.J.Medical College, Ahmedabad.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the compliance dated 10.04.2003 & 02.05.2003 received from the college authorities on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the Council Inspectors report (4th-6th March,2003) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission against the increased intake i.e. from 210 to 250 at B.J.Medical College, Ahmedabad for the academic session 2003-04.

15. To consider the matter of approval of Maharashtra Instt. of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pune University along with the legal opinion obtained in the matter as per the decision of the Executive Committee.

Read : The matter of approval of Maharashtra Instt. of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pune University along with the legal opinion obtained in the matter as per the decision of the Executive Committee.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee considered the matter with regard to approval of Maharashtra Instt. of Medical Education & Research, Talegaon for the award of MBBS degree granted by Pune University along with legal opinion obtained in light of the latest information i.e. Memorandum of Understanding submitted by the authorities of the college. The operative part of the legal opinion is as under:-

“.....the office of the Council may immediately inform the MAEER Medical College, Talegaon to furnish to the Council the duly registered lease deed for 17 acres and 21 gunthas of land and also duly registered sale/conveyance sale deed for 21 acres and 34 gunthas as per the stated Memorandum of Understanding between the parties on 30.4.03. The management of the college may be requested by the office of the Council to immediately furnish both the above-mentioned registered deeds thereby enabling the Council to make appropriate suitable recommendations to the Central Government in accordance with its rules and regulations.

There is no doubt that the both the abovementioned parties who have entered into the abovementioned arrangement, are necessarily required to get both the lease deeds and the sale deed registered as expeditiously as possible. This position has also been accepted by them in para 6 of the Memorandum of Understanding dated 30.4.2003. The office of the Council may therefore, while keeping in mind the interest of the students, impress upon these parties to get these deeds registered forthwith enabling the Council to take further appropriate action in this matter.”

The Committee decided that authorities of the college be advised to get the sale deed registered in the appropriate office and copy of the same be submitted to the Council for further consideration in the matter.

16. Appointment of Zonal Inspectors (North, South and East zone)– Approval of.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee approved the following recommendations of the Selection Committee constituted for the post of Zonal Inspectors, which met on 4.5.2003:-

North Zone	-	None
East Zone	-	Dr. Sakuntala Chakraborty
South Zone	-	Dr. K. Ananda Kannan

17. Appointments of Peons and Messenger in the Council office– Approval of.

The Executive Committee and members of the Adhoc Committee approved the following recommendations of the Selection Committee constituted for the posts of Peon (General-2, PH-1) and Messenger (SC-1) in the Council office, which met on 27.04.2003:-

Peon (General-2):

1. Shri Devanand
2. Shri Man Singh

Waiting:

1. Shri Jai Prakash
2. Shri Sunil Kumar

Peon (PH-1)

1. Shri Umesh Chandra

Waiting:

1. Shri Sunil Kumar

Messenger (SC-1):

1. Shri Kishan Singh Chauhan

Waiting:

1. Shri Sombeer Singh

18. Date and Venue of the next meeting of the Executive Committee.

The next meeting of the Executive Committee shall be held on 2nd June,2003 at 11.00 a.m. in the Council office, Aiwan-E-Galib Marg, Kotla Road, New Delhi-110 002.

(Dr. K.K. Arora)
Joint Secretary

New Delhi, dated
the 5th May,2003.

A P P R O V E D

(Dr. P.C.Kesavankutty Nayar)
President (Acting)

