

**Medical Council of India**

**New Delhi**

Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Governors held on 23<sup>rd</sup> April, 2012 at 10.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector-8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi -110077.

Following members were present:

- |    |                                |                                    |
|----|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1. | Dr. (Prof.) K.S. Sharma        | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 2. | Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam        | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 3. | Dr. Rajiv Chintaman Yeravdekar | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 4. | Dr. Purshotam Lal              | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 5. | Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta          | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 6. | Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas         | Member, Board of Governors         |
| 7. | Dr. P.Prasannaraj              | Member Secretary I/C, BOG meeting. |

Leave of absence was received from Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar, Chairman, Board of Governors.

**1. Approval of minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 17.03.2012.**

The Board of Governors approved the minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 17.03.2012.

**2. Approval on the minutes of the Equivalence Committee held on 16.01.2012.**

The Board of Governors approved the minutes of the Equivalence Committee held on 16.01.2012.

**3. Increase of seats from 150 to 200 at Krishna Institute of Medical Sciences, Karad, Regarding submission of Declaration forms of Teaching Faculties, Standard Inspection Form "A" & "B".**

This agenda item withdrawn by the office as it has already been considered by the Board of Governors at its meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> April, 2012.

4. **Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 seats instead of 100 to 200 seats at Navodaya Medical College, Raichur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 - regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 seats instead of 100 to 200 seats at Navodaya Medical College, Raichur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 - regarding.

The Board of Governors noted the request of Navodaya Medical College, Raichur to reconsider their application for increase in intake of seats from 100 to 150 seats instead of 100 to 200 seats u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 and decided to consider the same as the assessment is yet to be accomplished.

5. **Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 seats at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 - regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 seats at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 - regarding.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 seats at Sree Balaji Medical College & Hospital, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 and noted that the college having essentiality certificate issued in 2007, was assessed on 5<sup>th</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> April, 2011 and deficiencies pointed out in the said assessment have been communicated to the college authorities the last date for submission of compliance u/s 10A was 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2011 but the college submitted the compliance by 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2011. Hence, the application could not be considered and the college was advised to apply a fresh next year. The board considered the matter in light of the assessment done earlier and the application submitted by the college for increase of seats from 100 to 150 and decided for revalidation of essentiality certificate issued 3 years back by Competent State Signatory Authority for further processing of the application u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

6. **Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar is permitted but is yet not recognized for 100 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

7. **Increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry is permitted but is yet not recognized for 150 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

8. **Increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 200 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore is permitted but is yet not recognized for 150 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

9. **Increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Rajarajeswari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore is permitted but is yet not recognized for 150 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

10. **Increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Amritsar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Amritsar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 at Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Amritsar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Sri Guru Ram Das Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Amritsar is permitted but is yet not recognized for 100 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

**11. Increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mysore Medical College & Research Institute, Mysore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mysore Medical College & Research Institute, Mysore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of MBBS seats from 150 to 250 at Mysore Medical College & Research Institute, Mysore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2012-13 and decided that since Mysore Medical College & Research Institute, Mysore is permitted but is yet not recognized for 150 seats, cannot be permitted for further increase of seats for academic year 2012-13 in view of the existing regulations. The board further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

**12. Establishment of new medical college at Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu by Employees' State Insurance Corporation, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to Establishment of new medical college at Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu by Employees' State Insurance Corporation, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to Establishment of new medical college at Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu by Employees' State Insurance Corporation, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 and decided and granted approval for withdrawal of application without any refund of fees. The board

further decided to return the application to the applicant as disapproved, since there is no provision in the IMC Act, 1956 or regulations framed thereunder to keep the application pending with the Council for the next academic year.

Medical Council of India

**13. Consideration of Minutes of the U.G. Committee - I held on 27/02/2012.**

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of Minutes of the U.G. Committee - I held on 27/02/2012.

The Board of Governors perused the recommendations of the Undergraduate Medical Education Committee -I meeting held on 27<sup>th</sup> February, 2012 and decided as under:-

Item No.	Name of the College / Institute with date of assessment	Type of Assessment	Decision of the Board of Governors
1.	Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur  Assessment dt. 23 <sup>rd</sup> - 24 <sup>th</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.	Not approved for renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually because of the following deficiencies:-  (i) Infrastructure: 2 lab. less in the department of physiology.  The college is directed to submit the compliance report on the deficiencies pointed out in the Council assessment report within 2 weeks failing which appropriate action would be taken by the Council.
1(a)	S.R.T.R. Medical College, Ambajogai  Assessment dt. 5 <sup>th</sup> & 6 <sup>th</sup> September, 2011	Continuance of recognition	Not approved for continuance of recognition for 50 admissions annually in view of the following deficiencies:-  1. Shortage of faculty 15% (i) Prof. - 10 (Microbiology - 1, Forensic Medicine -1, General Medicine -1, Dermatology -1, Psychiatry -1, TB & Chest -

			<p>1, Orthopaedics -1, Ophthalmology -1, Radio-diagnosis -1, Dentistry -1)</p> <p>(ii) Assoc.Prof.- 2 (Paediatrics -1, Surgery -1)</p> <p>(iii) Asst.Prof. -2 (Psychiatry -1 &amp; TB &amp; Chest -1)</p> <p>2. Number of static x-ray units less (one of 300 mA and one of 500 mA.</p> <p>The college is directed to submit the compliance report on the deficiencies pointed out in the Council assessment report within 3 months failing which appropriate action would be taken by the Council.</p> <p>A copy of the letter may be marked to DME and Secretary (Health), Maharashtra.</p>
2.	<p>Career Institute of Medical Sciences &amp; Hospital, Lucknow</p> <p>Assessment dt. 30<sup>th</sup> &amp; 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2012</p>	<p>Renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually</p>	<p>Not approved for Renewal of permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually. The college is directed to submit the compliance report on the deficiencies pointed out in the Council assessment report within 2 weeks failing which appropriate action would be taken by the Council.</p> <p>The deficiencies observed are as under:-</p> <p>(i) Gross deficiency of OT equipments.</p> <p>(a) No Central AC</p> <p>(b) No Respiratory Gas Monitor only pulse oximeter available.</p>



			<p>(c) No infusion pump.</p> <p>(d) No ventilator in General Surgery, OBG &amp; ENT OT.</p> <p>(e) Emergency OT - The emergency care room, minor OT and OT need to improve on oxygen supply and central suction facility. Anaesthesia care services and anaesthesia machine available in this are needs improvement. The entire area needs air conditioning. No emergency dry tray.</p> <p>(ii) Departments of Pathology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Forensic Medicine and Community Medicine are housed in the hospital building and non-functional.</p> <p>(iii) X-ray - no log book available.</p> <p>(iv) Professor of Microbiology above 70 years of age.</p> <p>(v) Redistribution of medicine beds needs to be done.</p> <p>(vi) No defibrillator available.</p> <p>(vii) AERB and PNDT license not available - applied for.</p> <p>(viii) No Central AC in ICU.</p> <p>The board further noted the complaint against the college by Mr. Prashant Upadhya, Delhi alleging the irregularities with regard to the faculty, clinical material, infrastructure etc. &amp; another complaint dt. 15.3.2012 from Sh. A.C. Pratap regarding high fee and low standard of</p>
--	--	--	---

			medical education in career institute of medical Sciences & Hospital and decided that the matter may be referred to CVO for further investigation in the matter.
3.	M.P. Shah Medical College, Jamnagar  Assessment dt. 30 <sup>th</sup> & 31 <sup>st</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 175 to 200 seats.	Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 175 to 200 seats annually.  The board further noted the complaint against the college by Mr. Harshad J Pabari Jamnagar & another complaint by Intern doctors of Rajkot and Jamnagar regarding violation of MCI norms and misleading of MCI by officers of MP Shah Medical College, Jamnagar and decided that the matter may be referred to CVO for further investigation in the matter.
4.	Travancore Medical College, Kollam  Assessment dt. 30 <sup>th</sup> & 31 <sup>st</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually	The Board of Governors decided to defer the item for its subsequent meeting.
5.	Surat Municipal Institute of Medical Education and Research, Surat  Assessment dt. 30 <sup>th</sup> & 31 <sup>st</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from	Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats annually.

		100 to 150 seats annually.	
6.	Jhalawar Medical College, Jhalawar  Assessment dt. 24 <sup>th</sup> & 25 <sup>th</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 5 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.	Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 5 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.
7.	Alluri Sitarama Raju Academy of Medical Sciences, Eluru A.P.  Assessment dt. 30 <sup>th</sup> & 31 <sup>st</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.	The board noted that there is no assessment report and only Form-A and annexure were available and decided to defer the item for subsequent meeting.
8.	Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Farrukhabad U.P.  Assessment dt. 30 <sup>th</sup> & 31 <sup>st</sup> January, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.	Not approved for renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.  The college is directed to submit the compliance report on the deficiencies pointed out in the Council assessment report within 2 weeks failing which appropriate action would be taken by the Council.  The deficiencies observed are as under:-  (i) Blood Bank not present. PNDT and AERB licenses not available.

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(ii) Infrastructure inadequate; 4 labs less, 2 in Physiology, 1 in Pathology and 1 in Pharmacology.</li> <li>(iii) SICU not available.</li> <li>(iv) 1 PHC is less as per requirement.</li> <li>(v) Bed reallocation needs to be done in Medicine and allied specialities to meet the minimum requirement as noted above.</li> </ul>
9.	<p>Great Eastern Medical College &amp; Hospital, Ragolu, Srikakulam</p> <p>Assessment dt. 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 2<sup>nd</sup> February</p>	<p>Renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.</p>	<p>Not approved for renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 100 admissions annually.</p> <p>The college is directed to submit the compliance report on the deficiencies pointed out in the Council assessment report within 2 weeks failing which appropriate action would be taken by the Council.</p> <p>The deficiencies observed are as under:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(i) Bed occupancy is only 22%.</li> <li>(ii) OPD is only 250 as against required 600.</li> <li>(iii) The college has deficiency in faculty strength more so in senior cadres: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Prof. 5 out of 18 (25%) (Biochemistry -1, Surgery -1, Orthopaedics -1, ENT -1, Anaesthesia-1)</li> <li>(2) Assoc.Prof. 8 out of 22 (40%) (Pharmacology -1, Commu.Medicine -2, Medicine -2, Surgery -2, Orthopaedics -1)</li> <li>(3) Asst.Prof. 3 out of 43 (6%) (Anatomy -1, Radiology -1 &amp; Ophthalmology -1)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Sr. Resident 2 out of 27 (Psychiatry -1 &amp; Ophthalmology -1)</p>

			<p>(iv) The college has deficiency of nurses 98 as against required 175 (44%) and paramedical staff 70 as against required 101 (30.6%)</p> <p>(v) The infrastructure is also deficient in terms of lecture theatre (1 of 250 and 1 of 150 deficient), resident hostels, seating capacity in library and in facilities in RHTC, blood bank.</p> <p>(vi) The clinical material is also grossly inadequate - casualty attendance only 1, Investigation load is less. IPD is grossly deficient, Minor OT ill-equipped, major surgeries only 3, minor only 1. No patients in labour room, No emergency OT, Central oxygen supply not functioning, no ventilator.</p> <p>(vii) Pharmaco-Vigilance Committee - No meeting on record.</p> <p>The board further noted the complaint against the college by Mr. B P Acharya, Visakhapatnam regarding fraud during MCI inspection (no staff is working there they only attend inspection through agent called Aliah) and decided that the matter may be referred to CVO for further investigation in the matter.</p>
10.	<p>Saveetha Medical College and Hospital, Kanchipura</p> <p>Assessment dt. 2<sup>nd</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> February, 2012</p>	<p>Renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.</p>	<p>Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.</p> <p>However, the office is directed to obtain a valid Blood Bank license from the college within 1 week which is mandatory requirement as per regulations before issuing the Letter of Permission.</p>

11.	Gujarat Adani Institute of Medical sciences, Bhuj  1 <sup>st</sup> & 2 <sup>nd</sup> February, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.	Not approved for Renewal of permission for admission of 4 <sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually. The college is directed to rectify the following deficiencies and submit the compliance to the Council within 2 weeks.  (i) There is no Professor in Forensic Medicine and Pharmacology.  The board further noted the complaint against the college by Mr. Khambhaliya Bhimji H, GK General Hospital, Kutch, Gujarat regarding lack of facilities, staff, equipment in the radiology department of the college and decided that the matter may be referred to CVO for further investigation in the matter.
12.	Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore.  3 <sup>rd</sup> & 4 <sup>th</sup> February, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats annually.	Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats annually.  However, the office is directed to obtain a valid Blood Bank license from the college within 1 week which is mandatory requirement as per regulations before issuing the Letter of Permission.
13.	Madha Medical College & Hospital, Thandalam  Assessment dt. 1 <sup>st</sup> & 2 <sup>nd</sup> February, 2012	Renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions	Approved for renewal of permission for admission of 2 <sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students for 150 admissions annually.  However, the college is directed to rectify the following deficiencies and submit the compliance to the Council within 3 months.

		annually.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>(i) Associate Professor in TB &amp; Chest, Psychiatry not available.</li><li>(ii) Seating capacity is inadequate in library.</li><li>(iii) Re-organization of beds in Medicine &amp; allied subjects is required.</li></ul>
--	--	-----------	---

Medical Council of India

**14. Increase of seats in MS(General Surgery) course at Shri Ram Murti Smarak Institute of Medical Sciences, Bareilly.**

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MS(General Surgery) course at Shri Ram Murti Smarak Institute of Medical Sciences, Bareilly.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to increase of seats in MS(General Surgery) course at Shri Ram Murti Smarak Institute of Medical Sciences, Bareilly and passed the following order:-

1. Shri Ram Murti Smarak Trust has filed Writ Petition before the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi challenging the decision of the Board of Governors in Super-Session of the Medical Council of India to reject increase in admission capacity in MS (Surgery).
2. The Hon'ble High Court of Delhi vide order dated 20.04.2012 directed the Board of Governors (for short "BOG") to decide the representation submitted by Shri Ram Murti Smarak Trust (herein after referred to as "Trust") and communicate the decision to the Trust before 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2012 and place the order before the Hon'ble High Court on 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2012.
3. The BOG met on 23/04/2012 and perused the assessment reports, representations and a copy of Writ Petition.
4. The order of BOG was communicated to the Trust vide letter no. MCI-288(22)/2011-Med./100513, dated 22.03.2012 whereby BOG has rejected the application of Trust to increase the admission capacity in MS (General Surgery) course at Shri Ram Murti Smarak Institute of Medical Sciences, Bareilly from existing two admission to eleven admissions. The BOG in its order held that there is discrepancy in surgical work load shown by Trust in the application for increase in admission capacity of MS (General Surgery) from in comparison to application for increase in admission capacity in MD (Anesthesia).
5. However, on perusal of the representation and assessment report, it was found that there is no discrepancy in the clinical materials mentioned in the application of MS (Surgery) and MD (Anesthesia) as it was inadvertently mentioned in the above-mentioned MCI letter dated 22/03/12.
6. Therefore, the BOG decided to re-examine the application for increase of seats from two to eleven in MS (Surgery) on merit at its meeting held on 23.04.2012. The BOG after careful consideration of the assessment report came to



the conclusion that increase in admission capacity cannot be granted for reasons stated below.

7. The BOG considered relevant materials including the Circular of the Council issued to all Dean/Principal of all the medical colleges in the country bearing no. MCI-23(1)/2009-Med./53040, dated 30/11/2009. The Board has also taken into consideration the Protocol developed by the Board for assessment and evaluation of assessment report for grant/denial of increase/start of admission capacity in postgraduate medical courses.

8. The Circular dated 30/11/2009 provides, amongst others, following requirements:

*“Operative Work load – At least one major and two minor operations per day per teaching faculty and residents i.e. in a given unit having 3 teaching faculty members, the operative workload should be atleast 3 major and 6 minor operations per day for an institution running postgraduate courses in a surgical department. The operations theatre should function daily.”*

9. The criteria devised by BOG have also been taken into consideration and the same are as under :-

“Following Criteria for objective Assessments `:

1. Consent of Affiliation for the no. of seats

Note: We have to ensure that all the universities are mentioning # of seats in their Letters of consent

2. Number of Recognised Postgraduate Teachers :

- Professor
- Associate Professor
- Asstt. Professor
- Tutors
- Senior Residents/Junior Residents

3. No. of units/teaching beds (40 or 30)

4. Increase in seats in the last three years

5. Proportionate increase in clinical work >3 yrs.

- 10%
- 20%
- 30%

6. Proportionate increase in investigations >3 yrs.

- Biochemistry
- Histopathology
- X-rays
- MRI, CT Scan, Sonography
- Blood Cons etc.

7. Proportionate increase in Major/Minor Surgeries
8. Proportionate increase in Normal delivery, LSCS etc.,
9. Proportionate increase in scientific activities like publications in indexed/non indexed journals, participation in conferences and poster/Paper presentations by residents/PGs.
10. Any negative/subjective remarks by the assessors/CVC/CVO/CBI at UG/PG levels.
11. Any refusal for increase in seats/start of course in the previous assessment/years.”

10. In the light of above guidelines/circular, the Board comes to the conclusion that there is no justification for increase in admission capacity in MS (Surgery) from existing two admissions to eleven admissions for academic session 2012-2013. The Board has also taken into consideration the fact that the permission for starting of postgraduate in MS (Surgery) for 2 admissions were granted to the college for the first time in the year 2011-2012.

11. The circular dated 30/11/2009 lays down requirement of following (Minimum Standard Requirements for Medical College for 50/100/150 Admission Annually Regulations, 1999). It further lays down that minimum clinical material required in the clinical discipline as quantified by the Postgraduate Committee of the Medical Council of India are required to be met before permission for starting/increase of seats in postgraduate medical course can be granted.

12. The circular clearly provides that at least 1 Major and 2 Minor operations per day for per teaching faculty and it further provides that in a given unit having 3 teaching faculty members the operative workload should be at least 3 Major and 6 Minor operations per day for an institution running Postgraduate course in a surgical department. The total number of units in the Department of Surgery in the institute is 4 and as per the assessment report the total numbers of surgeries reported from department of General Surgery are 10 to 12 Major Surgeries and 14 to 16 Minor Surgeries per day. As there are four units, there ought to be 12 major surgeries and 24 minor surgeries everyday in the Department of Surgery. Thus, for four available units in Department of Surgery, the minimum number of minor surgeries performed is not as per the MCI norms.

13. The institute was permitted for 2 seats for starting of course in General Surgery in 2011 and it may be noted that there has been no proportionate increase in the clinical workload in terms of OPD and IPD till date. The average daily operative load has not shown hardly any increase since 2011 till date.

### **Comparison of Assessment Report of General Surgery 2011 and 2012**

Parameter	Assessment Report 2011	Assessment Report 2012
Average Daily OPD	154 Patients per day	155-160 patients per day
Average Daily IP	Admission 23 patients per day	18-20 patients per day
Average Bed occupancy	92%	93%
Average daily operations	Major 10, Minor 15 surgeries per day	Major 10-12, Minor 14-16 surgeries per day

**Year - wise available clinical materials (during previous three years) from the department of General Surgery**

<u>Years</u>	<u>O.P.D.</u>			<u>I.P.D.</u>	
	<u>New</u>	<u>Old</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Admission</u>	<u>Bed Occupancy in Percent</u>
<u>2011</u>	<u>27368</u>	<u>22593</u>	<u>49961</u>	<u>6522</u>	<u>93%</u>
<u>2010</u>	<u>27036</u>	<u>20483</u>	<u>47519</u>	<u>7144</u>	<u>92%</u>
<u>2009</u>	<u>28289</u>	<u>21298</u>	<u>49587</u>	<u>6017</u>	<u>81%</u>

14. A perusal of the above chart indicates that the number of IPD patients in the year 2011 has gone down to 6522 from 7144 in the year 2010. However, the percentage of bed occupancy is shown to increase from 92% to 93%. In a Hospital, with decrease in IPD strength rise in bed occupancy is not possible.

15. The BOG has applied the above-listed criteria for assessment of the report and found that there is no increase in clinical work in the concerned subject. The BOG has noticed the marginal increase in average operative workload in other subjects as quoted in the Assessment Report of Anesthesiology and it has accordingly approved the increase in MD (Anesthesiology) from two to four seats. There is no increase in clinical material in Surgery since last inspection and therefore there is no reason to grant increase in admission capacity.

16. The BOG has taken into consideration the assessment reports in MD Anesthesia as well as MS Surgery and it was noted that though there is no inconsistency in data in respect of operative workload, however, having regard that there is no increase in clinical material, like OPD, IPD and minor surgeries, it does not justify increase in admission capacity in MS (Surgery).

17. The BOG is conscious of the fact that increase is being sought in this important broad specialty and at this stage there cannot be any compromise in the standards of medical education and in absence of adequate clinical material, the standard of medical education at the level of postgraduate course in the subject may not be of highest standard.

18. Therefore, the BOG reaffirms its earlier decision dated 22.3.2012 of not approving increase in admission capacity in MS (Surgery) from existing two to eleven for reasons stated above and rejects representations dated 23/03/12, 29/3/2012 and 02/04/12.

**15. Appeal by Dr. Kunal Shah against Dr. Ketan Desai**

Read: the matter with regard to appeal by Dr. Kunal Shah against Dr. Ketan Desai.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to appeal by Dr. Kunal Shah against Dr. Ketan Desai and decided for defer the matter for its next meeting.

**Any other item.**

The board considered the matter with regard to current criteria for head of the department and decided that Chancellor, Pro-Vice-Chancellor, Vice Chancellor, Registrar of University if having fulfilled the requirements of professor as per the "Minimum Qualifications for Teachers in Medical Institutions Regulations 1998", they can be in charge of a Unit but cannot be HOD in the medical college/institution. However, they can teach and practice in the Department concerned.

(Dr. P. Prasannaraj)  
Secretary I/C

(Dr.(Prof.) K.S. Sharma)  
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) H S Rissam)  
Member

(Dr. Rajiv C Yeravdekar)  
Member

(Dr. Purshotam Lal)  
Member

(Dr. Ashok Gupta)  
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas)  
Member

Medical Council of India