

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA

NEW DELHI

Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Governors held on 26.09.2011 at 10.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector-8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110077.

Following members were present:

1.	Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar	Chairman, Board of Governors
2.	Dr. (Prof.) K.S. Sharma	Member, Board of Governors
3.	Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam	Member, Board of Governors
4.	Dr. Rajiv Chintaman Yeravdekar	Member, Board of Governors
5.	Dr. Purshotam Lal	Member, Board of Governors
6.	Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta	Member, Board of Governors
7.	Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas	Member, Board of Governors
8.	Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma	Secretary, Member Secretary, BOG meeting.
9.	Dr. P.Prasannaraj	Addl. Secretary

1. Minutes of the BOG's meetings dated 19.09.2011 - Confirmation of.

The Board of Governors confirmed the minutes of the meeting held on 19.09.2011.

2. Action taken on the minutes of the meeting as reported till 23.09.2011

The Board of Governors noted the action taken on the minutes of the meeting as reported till 23.09.2011.

3. Improvement required in the process of Assessment. - as suggested by Chief Vigilance Officer, MCI.

Read: the matter with regard to the improvement suggested in the process of assessment of Medical College and PG Courses.

The Board of Governors considered the matter regarding improvement required in the process of assessment and noted the following:

1. There is no method in the council office to assess the claim of the college through the documents as submitted with the initial application, as no proper scrutiny is being done in the council office.
2. The Roles/Responsibility of the respective sections in this regard needs to be defined and put in place so that there is a multiple system of checking the claim and the decision is not merely taken on the Assessor's report. Rather the Assessor needs to be provided input by the concerned section in-charge in assessing a particular institution based on the documents provided.
3. The Assessment is simply based on the Assessors Report and the wisdom of the scrutiny committee.
4. Assessor needs to be suitably trained for this purpose. An assessor guide and minimum standard requirements may be provided to him for the particular assignment.
5. Clear do's & don'ts should be laid down for the assessors.
6. Assessor appointed by the MCI is supposed to Assess the facilities present in the Medical Colleges as per minimum standard requirements as prescribed by the MCI for starting a course/increase in seats by adopting suitable measures. He is not deputed just for physical verification of the facilities shown to him on the date of Assessment, but

has to verify and establish the colleges claim. These aspects should be made clear to the Assessor.

7. The assessment report should be signed by all assessors on all pages.
8. He should also be informed of the consequences of wrong reporting in case, his claims are found to be false at a later stage.
9. The format of the assessment should be so devised that the assessor is able to detail his findings, so that a judicious decision can be taken in the council.
10. The Assessment should be made periodical rather than an annual exercise when all concerned are aware of the Assessment schedule.
11. The report of the Assessor as received in the office of the Council should be immediately acknowledged and signed on all pages by the designated authority.
12. The Undergraduate/Postgraduate Committees analyzing/scrutinizing the Assessment Report must give its decisions as speaking orders.
13. The final decisions of the Board of Governors to permit/reject the application of the Medical College/Institute must also be in speaking orders.

The Board of Governors in the light of the above suggestions directed the Council office to circulate the standard operating procedure for assessment in the BOG meeting scheduled on 10.10.2011 and prepare exclusive agenda item for discussion in the meeting to be held on 17.10.2011.

4. **Datta Meghe Institute of Medical Sciences University -Recognition of MS(Orthopaedics) qualification in respect of students being trained at J.N. Medical College, Swangi, Wardha in respect of increased intake-CBI report in PE 1(A)/2010-NGP against Shri P.P. Kotwal HOD Orthopaedics, AIIMS and others along with the report of the CVO of the MCI.**

Read: the matter with regard to the Datta Meghe Institute of Medical Sciences University -Recognition of MS(Orthopaedics) qualification in respect of students being trained at J.N. Medical College, Swangi, Wardha in respect of increased intake-CBI report in PE 1(A)/2010-NGP against Shri P.P. Kotwal, HOD Orthopaedics, AIIMS and others along with the report of the CVO of the MCI.

The Board of Governors considered the above matter in light of the letter dt. 08.02.2011 received from the CBI and the point-wise suggestions made by CVO of Medical Council of India alongwith the decision of the BOGs which reads as under:

- i) To review the system of sending panel of inspectors so that no retired professors are sent for the inspections.

It was informed that already this suggestion has been implemented and retired professors are no longer sent for inspection. The Board of Governors decided to review the system of assessment process of various undergraduate and postgraduate courses (reference Item No.3) mentioned above.

- ii) The Board of Governors of Medical council should review the recognition granted for three seats of MS(Orthopaedics) to JNM College, Swangi Meghe on the basis of the inspection conducted by Dr. Datta Tamloorkar who was the retired Professor.

The Board of Governors concurred with the decision of the previous Board of Governors to review the recognition granted for 3 (Three) seats in MS(Orthopaedic) to J.N. Medical College, Swangi, Wardha by conducting an assessment for physical verification of the available faculty, infrastructure and clinical material at present.

- iii) The New Board of Governors of Medical Council of India should bring in necessary regulations about the practicing or non-practicing or non-practicing status of the faculties and about introducing the definition of the term “full time faculties” in its main statute and regulations.

The Board of Governors decided to refer the matter to the Academic Council of the Medical Council of India.

5. Request for permission to Dr. Amardeep Singh for re-admission for the PG course discontinued by him.

Read: the matter with regard to the request for permission to Dr. Amardeep Singh for re-admission for the MD (General Medicine) PG course discontinued by him.

The Board of Governors considered the request for permission to Dr. Amardeep Singh for continuation of his admission for the PG course and directed the college authorities that continuation of Dr. Amardeep Singh in the MD (General Medicine) course is permitted subject to the condition that there shall not be any increase of PG intake in the General Medicine course.

6. Recognition of Postgraduate qualification in respect of Santosh Medical College Ghaziabad – regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to the recognition of Postgraduate qualification in respect of Santosh Medical College Ghaziabad.

The Board of Governors considered the matter and approved the minutes of the postgraduate committee.

7. Draft Agreement on Mutual Recognition and Equivalence of Educational Diplomas and Degrees completed from Russian Federation with Medical Council of India.

Read: the matter with regard to the Draft Agreement on Mutual Recognition and Equivalence of Educational Diplomas and Degrees completed from Russian Federation with Medical Council of India.

The Board of Governors considered the draft agreement on mutual recognition and equivalence of educational diplomas and degrees completed from Russian Federation with Medical Council of India and directed the Council to put up on file to Dr. Mohan Das, Member BOG, Vice-Chancellor, Kerala University of Health Sciences.

This agreement between the Govt. of India and the Russian Federation is a general agreement dealing with general higher education. In the agreement there is no mention of medical education. As far as medical regulations is concerned any student of Indian origin who intends to practice or pursue his higher education in India following successful completion of medical education in Russia it is mandatory to pass the screening test.

8. Matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Venkatesan J. Medical Teacher.

Read: the matter with regard to the Matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Venkatesan J. Medical Teacher.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Venkatesan J. Medical Teacher and noted that the sequence of events as presented in the agenda is not in chronological order and there is substantial delay between the directions of the competent authority and its subsequent action by the concerned authority. The Board directed the Council to place all the sequence of events in proper order with all the details in the next meeting.

9. Increase of MBBS seats in the 3 (three) Medical Colleges of State of Madhya Pradesh - Regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to the increase of MBBS seats in the 3 (three) Medical Colleges of State of Madhya Pradesh.

The Board of Governors considered the matter of increase of MBBS seats from 140 to 150 in the 3 (three) Medical Colleges of State of Madhya Pradesh namely Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal, MGM Medical College, Indore, G.R. Medical College, Gwalior following the request from the Director Medical Education, Madhya Pradesh, vide letter No. 1386/DME/PG/2011, dated 02.07.2011. In the light of the facts that the requirements for 140 seats are considered as per the Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirement for 150 seats.

The Board of Governors considered the matter regarding the request for increase of MBBS seats from 140 to 150 admissions at Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal and noted that the institution has been granted continuation of recognition for 140 admissions after due approval of the General Body of the Council at its meeting held on 11.03.2010. Regarding requests for grant of permission for increase of seats from 140 to 150 admissions, the Board of Governors directed the Council to process the request as per the provisions of Section 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Board of Governors considered the matter regarding the request for increase of MBBS seats from 140 to 150 admissions at Mahatma Gandhi Mission Medical College, Indore and noted that the institution has not yet been granted continuation of recognition for 140 admissions. On appointment of the assessors the date of the assessment of the college was fixed as 19th & 20th August, 2011 for which the Dean requested for postponement of the assessment by two weeks. The Board directed the Council that if the request submitted by the college authorities for increase of seats from 140 to 150 admissions is in accordance with the MCI rules then the assessment for continuation of recognition of 140 seats and the assessment for increase of seats may be clubbed together and assessment may be done.

The Board of Governors considered the matter regarding the request for increase of MBBS seats from 140 to 150 admissions at G.R. Medical College, Gwalior and noted that the institution has not yet been granted continuation of recognition for 140 admissions. On appointment of the assessors the date of the assessment of the college was fixed as 16th & 17th August, 2011 for which the Dean of the college requested for postponement of the assessment by two to three weeks. The Board directed the Council that if the request submitted by the college authorities for increase of seats from 140 to 150 admissions is in accordance with the MCI rules then the assessment for continuation of recognition of 140 seats and the assessment for increase of seats may be clubbed together and assessment may be done.

10. Eligibility of Dr. Manoj Pandey for the post of Associate Professor in the department of Surgical Oncology at Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi.

Read: the matter with regard to the Eligibility of Dr. Manoj Pandey for the post of Associate Professor in the department of Surgical Oncology at Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi.

The Board of Governors considered the qualification and experience of Dr. Manoj Pandey and found that he is eligible for the post of Associate Professor in the Department of Surgical Oncology.

11. Consideration of assessment reports receive after last date of issuance of LOP - reg.

Read: the matter with regard to the consideration of assessment reports received after last date of issuance of LOP.

The Board of Governors directed the Council to present the details of all the pending applications u/s 10A received for the postgraduate courses for the academic year 2011-2012 in the year 2010-2011. The reasons may be mentioned, along with the legal opinion and precedence for considering such applications after the stipulated date prescribed by the Regulations.

12. Request for refund of assessment fees pertaining to Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar.

Read: the matter with regard to the request for refund of assessment fees pertaining to Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar.

The Board of Governors considered the request for refund of assessment fees pertaining to Padmashri Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and directed the Council to consider the matter in the light of the rule position of the Council.

13. Appraisal of the legal matter of intake in MS(Ortho) and D.Ortho. Courses at S.S. Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University - Regarding Writ Petition No. 13939/06 - Dr. Vishal Bansal Vs. State of MP & Ors.

Read: the matter with regard to the appraisal of the legal matter of intake in MS (Ortho) and D.Ortho. Courses at S.S. Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University - Regarding Writ Petition No. 13939/06 - Dr. Vishal Bansal Vs. State of MP & Ors.

The Board of Governors considered the matter of intake in MS(Ortho) and D.Ortho. Courses at S.S. Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University - and in compliance of the court order against the Writ Petition No. 13939/06 filed by Dr. Vishal Bansal Vs. State of MP & Ors., the Central Govt. granted recognition for MS (Ortho) and D.Ortho qualification for S.S. Medical College, Rewa awarded by the A.P. Singh University and notified the same vide notification dated 09.08.2011 with following proviso:-

"This shall be a recognized medical qualification when granted by A.P. Singh University Madhya Pradesh in respect of students admitted between the academic year 1980-81 to 2008-09 and being trained at S.S. Medical College, Rewa, Madhya Pradesh."

The Board of Governors following the direction of the government decided to grant recognition to MS (Ortho) and D.Ortho. Courses being run at S.S. Medical College, Rewa under A.P. Singh University in respect of students admitted between the academic year 1980-81 to 2008-09.

14. Narayana Medical College & Hospital, Jamuhar, Bihar - Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2011-2012.

Read: the matter with regard to the Narayana Medical College & Hospital, Jamuhar, Bihar - Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2011-2012.

The Board of Governors considered the matter and noted the reply provided by assessors Dr. Narayan Shekhawat, Prof. Of General Surgery, SMS Medical College, Jaipur vide e-mail dt. 12.08.2011 & Dr. C. Ramakrishna, Prof. of ENT, Osmania Medical College vide e-mail dt. 10.08.2011 in response the Council letter dt. 05.08.2011. The Board of Governors directed the Council to obtain the reply of the 3rd assessor namely Dr. T.S. Ranganath, Professor of PSM, Govt. Medical College, Bangalore who has not sent the reply.

The assessment report was reviewed by the UG Committee and Board of Governors and the following deficiencies have been identified:-

1. Shortage of nursing staff.
2. CT scan not available.
3. Low OPD attendance.
4. Blood Bank not available.
5. Deficiency of 01 Primary Health Centre
6. Inadequate capacity of library.
7. No hostel accommodation for Interns, Residents and Nurses.
8. Inadequate number & distribution of teaching beds.
9. Less number of beds in RICU, PICU & NICU.

In view of the deficiencies identified, the Board of Governors did not grant LOP and disapproved the application u/s 10A. The college authorities in the court highlighted the recommendations provided by the assessors despite deficiencies which has caused lot of embarrassment to the Council. The assessors may be informed to conduct assessment in future as per the assessment guidelines by providing facts and avoiding recommendations.

15. Assessment of the infrastructure, teaching facilities; equipments available for MBBS course at Adesh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhatinda, Punjab.

Read: the matter with regard to the assessment of the infrastructure, teaching facilities; equipments available for MBBS course at Adesh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhatinda, Punjab.

The Board of Governors considered the show cause notice issued to the college authorities following deficiencies identified during the assessment dt. 5th & 6th July, 2011 for which the college authorities had submitted compliance report dt. 13.08.2011. The Board expressed their concern that the college authorities have not sent their reply to the show cause notice and hence the compliance report cannot be taken into consideration. The Council is directed to inform the college authorities to send appropriate reply for the show cause notice giving detailed explanation for the deficiencies identified during the assessment.

The Board of Governors are quite pained that no action has been taken to obtain the explanation from the college authorities for the show cause notice issued vide letter dated 26.07.2011. The Board directed the Council to submit the explanation for no action being taken in this regard and take appropriate action to obtain the explanation from the college authorities for the show cause notice issued.

16. To maintain Uniformity in the teaching cadres in all the Government Medical Colleges as well as Private Medical Colleges across the Country.

Read: the matter with regard to maintain uniformity in the teaching cadres in all the government medical colleges as well as private medical colleges across the country.

The item was deferred for detailed discussion in the next meeting.

17. Recognition/ approval of Kannur Medical College, Kannur, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for awarding of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University - Regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to the recognition/ approval of Kannur Medical College, Kannur, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for awarding of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University.

The Board of Governors considered the Recognition/ approval of Kannur Medical College, Kannur, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for awarding of MBBS degree granted by Kannur University and recommended for grant of recognition of MBBS degree awarded by Kannur University of the MBBS course conducted at Kannur Medical College, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956. Decision recorded on file.

18. SUT Academy of Medical Sciences, Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala - Request u/s 11(2) of the IMC act, 1956 - Regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to the SUT Academy of Medical Sciences, Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala - Request u/s 11(2) of the IMC act, 1956.

The Board of Governors considered the recognition/ approval of SUT Academy of Medical Sciences, Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for awarding of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University and recommended for grant of recognition of MBBS degree awarded by Kerala University of the MBBS course conducted at SUT Academy of Medical Sciences, Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956. Decision recorded on file.

19. Starting of MD (Forensic Medicine) course at Sri Aurbindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore under Devi Ahilya Viswavidalya, Indore u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act. 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to the Starting of MD (Forensic Medicine) course at Sri Aurbindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore under Devi Ahilya Viswavidalya, Indore u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act. 1956.

The Board of Governors considered the Starting of MD (Forensic Medicine) course at Sri Aurbindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore under Devi Ahilya Viswavidalya, Indore u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act. 1956 and in compliance to the court order approved for grant of Letter of Permission for admission of three students in MD (Forensic Medicine) course. Decision recorded on file.

20. In pursuance of the court order Compliance submitted by the authorities of MM Institute of Medical Sciences, Mullana, Ambala for Increase of seats in Postgraduate courses (Ortho, OBG, Surgery, Medicine, Ophthalmology & DVL).

Read: the matter with regard to the In pursuance of the court order Compliance submitted by the authorities of MM Institute of Medical Sciences, Mullana, Ambala for Increase of seats in Postgraduate courses (Ortho, OBG, Surgery, Medicine, Ophthalmology & DVL).

The Board of Governors considered the matter in pursuance of the court order compliance submitted by the authorities of MM Institute of Medical Sciences, Mullana, Ambala for increase of seats in postgraduate courses (Ortho, OBG, Surgery, Medicine, Ophthalmology & DVL) and observed that the clinical material over the past three years has shown an improvement of less than 1% in the said courses.

In view of the above, the Board of Governors decided to conduct assessment for physical verification of infrastructure, clinical material and faculty availability in the above mentioned PG courses at MM Institute of Medical Sciences, Mullana, Ambala.

21. Qualifying Marks in Entrance Examination - NEET - UG/PG.

Read: the matter with regard to the Qualifying Marks in Entrance Examination - NEET - UG/PG.

The Board of Governors considered the qualifying marks in entrance examination - NEET - UG/PG and deferred for the next meeting for final decision.

22. Complaint against Subharti Medical College, Meerut regarding irregularities in the admission process and demanding of capitation fees.

Read: the matter with regard to the Complaint against Subharti Medical College, Meerut regarding irregularities in the admission process and demanding of capitation fees.

The item was deferred for the next meeting for detailed discussion.

23. Consideration and approval on the minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 23.08.2011.

Read: the matter with regard to the consideration and approval on the minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 23.08.2011.

The Board of Governors considered the minutes of the Ethics Committee held on 23.08.2011 and deferred for the next meeting for approval.

24. Consideration and approval on the minutes of the Postgraduate Committee held on 04.08.2011; 09.08.2011.

Read: the matter with regard to the consideration and approval on the minutes of the Postgraduate Committee held on 04.08.2011; 09.08.2011.

The Board of Governors considered and approved the minutes of the Postgraduate Committee held on 04.08.2011; 09.08.2011.

The meeting ended with the vote of thanks by Dr. Sangeeta Sharma, Secretary, MCI.

(Dr.P.Prasannaraj)
Addl. Secretary

(Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma)
Secretary

(Prof. K.S. Sharma)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) H S Rissam)
Member

(Dr. Rajiv C Yeravdekar)
Member

(Dr. Purushotham Lal)
Member

(Dr. Ashok Gupta)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar)
Chairman