

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA

NEW DELHI

Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Governors held on 14.11.2011 at 10.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector -8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi -110077.

Following members were present:

1.	Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar	Chairman, Board of Governors
2.	Dr. (Prof.) K.S. Sharma	Member, Board of Governors
3.	Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam	Member, Board of Governors
4.	Dr. Rajiv Chintaman Yeravdekar	Member, Board of Governors
5.	Dr. Purshotam Lal	Member, Board of Governors
6.	Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta	Member, Board of Governors
7.	Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas	Member, Board of Governors
8.	Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma	Secretary, Member Secretary, BOG meeting.

1. Confirmation of the minutes of the BOGs meeting held on 08.11.2011.

The Board of Governors confirmed the minutes of the Board of Governors meeting held on 08.11.2011.

2. Action taken on the minutes of the BOGs meeting held on 10.10.2011, 17.10.2011, 24.10.2011 & 28.10.2011.

The Board of Governors noted action taken on the minutes of the meetings held on 10.10.2011, 17.10.2011, 24.10.2011 & 28.10.2011.

3. Establishment of new medical college at Haldia, West Bengal by Indian Centre for Advancement of Research and Education, Haldia, West Bengal.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Haldia, West Bengal by Indian Centre for Advancement of Research and Education, Haldia, West Bengal.

In response to the Show Cause Notice dated 31/10/2011, the college authorities vide letter dated 08/11/2011 have submitted their reply, the salient points in the reply reads as under:

“

<i>Deficiencies pointed out</i>	<i>Reply submitted by the College authorities</i>
<i>The college is not having 20 Acres of land</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>In addition to the said 27.45 acres of land, the society has acquired additional 7 acres of land from Haldia Development Authority</i> • <i>It is thus clear that ICARE Society had 34 acres of contiguous land in Haldia</i> • <i>Had established Haldia Dental College in 6.9 acres of land (forming part of the 27.45 acres of land owned by ICARE Society).</i> • <i>Therefore when ICARE Society decided to establish IIMSAR in 2010, it had demarcated 27.45 acres of land and earmarked 5.2 acres exclusively for Haldia Dental College, and 22.25 acres was earmarked for IIMSAR</i> • <i>It is clear from the details of lands provided above that the lands earmarked for IIMSAR and Haldia Dental College are distinct, that there is no overlapping of lands, and that both the medical college and dental college have a separate campus.</i>
<i>The main building, housing the Medical College also houses some of the departments of Dental</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Total floor area of Medical college does not include the floor area of Blocks 1 & 2 of the Dental College.</i> • <i>College building gave an impression that they formed part of the Medical College in view of a common running corridor between</i>

<p>College, i.e., the medical college building is also being utilized for several departments of dental college and therefore medical college is not having separate building and facilities.</p>	<p>Medical College Building and Blocks 1 & 2 of Haldia Dental College. IIMSAR has now permanently closed the common corridor.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Few departments of the Dental College had been housed in about 18, 235 sq. Ft. of the Medical College building. As also observed in Assessment Report. • Besides Blocks 1 & 2, Haldia Dental College also has three other buildings (Blocks 3, 4 and 5) totally unconnected with the Medical College Building. All the five buildings stand on the 5.2 acres of land earmarked for Haldia Dental College. Dental departments which had been housed in the Medical College Building have now been shifted to the exclusive buildings of Haldia Dental College. Now there are absolutely no dental departments in the Medical College Building.
<p>The medical college has obtained Letter of Permission by fraud and the factum of dental college running from medical college has been concealed and the Board of Governors were misled in granting Letter of Permission</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has not obtained the LOP by fraud. Floor Plans of ICARE Society/ IIMSAR as annexed with the reply to show cause reflect the existence of dental departments in the Medical College Building. • Medical College building was inspected by MCI Assessors twice before the LOP was granted on 30/06/2011. The factum of some dental departments being housed in the Medical College Building could not have escaped the attention of the MCI Assessors during inspection. • Dental departments being housed in the Medical College and that they would be shifted to the new blocks of Haldia Dental College was repeatedly told to the assessors. • Since the few dental departments which had been housed in the Medical College Building have now been shifted to the buildings exclusively belonging to Haldia Dental College, and there are no dental departments in the Medical College Building, IIMSAR requests the Board of Governors to graciously condone temporary presence of the dental departments and not punish IIMSAR by cancelling the LOP on this charge.
<p>There was a 11% deficiency of Faculty; there was 29% deficiency of Residents; there was a deficiency of 1 Nursing Superintendent and 24 Nursing Sisters; and on the day of assessment, the clinical material was inadequate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • IIMSAR remained closed for Durga Puja from 30/09/2011 to 11/10/2011. Four consecutive days, i.e. 03/10/2011 to 06/10/2011 were declared by West Bengal Government, holidays for Durga Puja. • Inspection by MCI Assessors was done on 07/10/2011 and 08/10/2011 during the Durga Puja vacation of IIMSAR, and the day immediately after the four consecutive West Bengal Government holidays for Durga Puja. Inspection was done within 3 days after the most important festival holidays cannot be made the basis for decision against IIMSAR. • IIMSAR had requested faculty to be present at the time of inspection who obliged by cutting short their vacation. • Same was the case with respect to shortage of Residents & Nursing staff.
<p>Most of the departments in medical college have shortage of space and are not adequately furnished.</p>	<p>➤ Few dental departments which were housed in the Medical College Building having been shifted out of the said building, there is no shortage of space now.</p>

The Board also noted legal opinion on the matter which is as below:

“OPINION

The Reply of ICARE Institute of Medical Science and Research & Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy Hospital, Haldia dated 8/11/2011 bearing reference no. IIMSAR/PO/113/2011 to the Show-Cause Notice bearing no.MCI-34 (41)/2011-MED/42429 dated 31/10/2011 has been placed for my opinion in respect of site plan submitted in respect of the Medical

College. I have perused the reply to the show-cause and I have also gone through the relevant Annexures.

"I have compared the site plan annexed with the Original Project Report and site plan annexed along with the reply show-cause. I find that the site plans are different. In the site plan submitted along with original report as at Annexure-10, the Dental College has not been shown to be part of the Medical College. However, in the site plan annexed as Annexure-12 to the reply to the show-cause, certain portion of the building of medical college has been shown as part of Dental College. Therefore, there is a discrepancy in this regard.

With regard to the claim of the college that it is having as on date more than twenty acre of land for medical college, it is difficult to state as to whether the claim of the Society is correct or not, Society may be requested to furnish certificate from the revenue/competent authority to MCI to the said effect which has been the practice followed in other similar applications for establishment of new medical college. In addition, Society may be asked to furnish due diligence report regarding ownership and area of land from an Advocate."

The Board of Governors considered the matter and noted that the land documents along with site plan submitted by the college at the time of application for establishment of a new college and the one submitted by the college in response to the show cause notice are show different allocation of area. The Board directed the council to take opinion of the Senior Advocate on this matter.

4. **Approval of the minutes of the joint meeting of the Academic Council and sub-Committee of the Academic Council on MSR held on 28.08.2011 & the Academic Council meeting held on 4th October, 2011.**

The Board of Governors considered the minutes of the joint meeting of the Academic Council and sub-Committee of the Academic Council on MSR held on 28.08.2011 & the Academic Council meeting held on 4th October, 2011 and decided that a presentation on the recommendation be made in the next meeting by Dr. AK Aggrawal and Dr. JM Kaul.

5. **Finalization of the Assessment Forms, Standard Operating Procedures, Assessor Guidelines, Declaration Form**

Read: the matter with regard to Finalization of the Assessment Form, Guidelines, Declaration Form etc.

The Board of Governors considered the forms revised by the sub-committee and approved the Assessment Forms, Assessor Guide, Standard Operating Procedures and Declaration Form with a few modifications for assessment of colleges. For establishment of new medical college and 200 & 250 seats, 4 assessors will be appointed. It was also decided to increase the remuneration of the assessors from Rs.2500/- (Rupees Two thousand five hundred only) per day to Rs.5000/- (Rupees Five thousand only) per day with a maximum of Rs.15000/- (Rupees Fifteen thousand only) per assessor per assessment.

6. **Location of R.H.T.C. at a distance from City.**

Read: the matter with regard to Location of R.H.T.C. at a distance from City.

The matter was deferred.

7. **Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinoba Bhave University, Dhanbad in respect of students being trained at Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad - Regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinoba Bhave University, Dhanbad in respect of students being trained at Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinoba Bhave University, Dhanbad in respect of students being trained at Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad and directed to place the assessment report before UG committee.

8. **Approval of minutes of meetings of Postgraduate Committee held on 27/09/2011, 14/10/2011 and 3-4/11/2011.**

Read: the matter with regard to Approval of minutes of meetings of Postgraduate Committee held on 27/09/2011, 14/10/2011 and 3-4/11/2011.

The matter was deferred.

9. **Starting of M.Ch. in Head & Neck Oncology.**

Read: the matter with regard to Starting of M.Ch. in Head & Neck Oncology

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to Starting of M.Ch. in Head & Neck Oncology and directed to present the case with all details of the existing courses in the next meeting.

10. **One year post doctoral certificate course (PDCC).**

Read: the matter with regard to one year post doctoral certificate course (PDCC).

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to one year post doctoral certificate course (PDCC) and referred the matter before Academic Council for defining the criteria for admission, course content, qualification of teacher, criteria for seat allocation etc.

The meeting ended with the vote of thanks by Dr. Sangeeta Sharma, Secretary, MCI.

(Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma)
Secretary

(Prof. K.S. Sharma)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) H S Rissam)
Member

(Dr. Rajiv C Yeravdekar)
Member

(Dr. Purshotam Lal)
Member

(Dr. Ashok Gupta)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar)
Chairman